

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

<b>PREFACE</b>	<b>I</b>
<b>SECTION 1 INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
2016 in Review	1
PJM Market Summary Statistics	6
PJM Market Background	6
Conclusions	7
Role of MMU	11
Reporting	11
Monitoring	11
Market Design	13
New Recommendations	13
New Recommendations from Section 3, Energy Market	13
New Recommendations from Section 4, Energy Uplift	14
New Recommendations from Section 5, Capacity Market	14
New Recommendation from Section 6, Demand Response	14
New Recommendations from Section 10, Ancillary Service Markets	14
Total Price of Wholesale Power	15
Components of Total Price	15
Section Overviews	19
Overview: Section 3, "Energy Market"	19
Overview: Section 4, "Energy Uplift"	26
Overview: Section 5, "Capacity Market"	31
Overview: Section 6, "Demand Response"	38
Overview: Section 7, "Net Revenue"	42
Overview: Section 8, "Environmental and Renewables"	43
Overview: Section 9, "Interchange Transactions"	46
Overview: Section 10, "Ancillary Services"	49
Overview: Section 11, "Congestion and Marginal Losses"	56
Overview: Section 12, "Planning"	58
Overview: Section 13, "FTRs and ARR"	62
<b>SECTION 2 RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>69</b>
New Recommendations	69
New Recommendations from Section 3, Energy Market	70
New Recommendation from Section 4, Energy Uplift	70
New Recommendations from Section 5, Capacity Market	71
New Recommendation from Section 6, Demand Response	71
New Recommendation from Section 10, Ancillary Service Markets	71
History of MMU Recommendations	71
Complete List of Current MMU Recommendations	72

Section 3, Energy Market	72
Section 4, Energy Uplift	75
Section 5, Capacity	77
Section 6, Demand Response	79
Section 7, Net Revenue	80
Section 8, Environmental	81
Section 9, Interchange Transactions	81
Section 10, Ancillary Services	82
Section 11, Congestion and Marginal Losses	83
Section 12, Planning	83
Section 13, FTRs and ARRs	84
Adopted 2006	85
Adopted 2008	85
Adopted 2009	85
Adopted 2010	86
Adopted 2011	86
Adopted 2012	86
Adopted 2013	86
Adopted 2014	87
Adopted 2015	87
Adopted 2016	89
Adopted Date Not Determined	89
<b>SECTION 3 ENERGY MARKET</b>	<b>91</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>92</b>
Market Structure	92
Market Behavior	93
Market Performance	94
Scarcity	95
Recommendations	95
Conclusion	97
<b>Market Structure</b>	<b>99</b>
Market Concentration	99
Ownership of Marginal Resources	101
Type of Marginal Resources	102
Supply	104
Demand	112
Supply and Demand: Load and Spot Market	118
<b>Market Behavior</b>	<b>120</b>
Offer Capping for Local Market Power	120
TPS Test Statistics	123
Parameter Limited Schedules	125
Markup Index	127
Energy Market Cost-Based Offers	131

Frequently Mitigated Units and Associated Units	133
Virtual Offers and Bids	134
Generator Offers	144
<b>Market Performance</b>	<b>146</b>
Markup	146
Prices	154
<b>Scarcity</b>	<b>171</b>
Emergency procedures	171
Scarcity and Scarcity Pricing	174
PJM Cold Weather Operations 2016	178
<b>SECTION 4 ENERGY UPLIFT (OPERATING RESERVES)</b>	<b>179</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>179</b>
Energy Uplift Results	179
Characteristics of Credits	179
Geography of Charges and Credits	179
Energy Uplift Issues	180
Energy Uplift Recommendations	180
Recommendations	180
Conclusion	182
<b>Energy Uplift</b>	<b>183</b>
Credits and Charges Categories	183
<b>Energy Uplift Results</b>	<b>185</b>
Energy Uplift Charges	185
Operating Reserve Rates	188
Reactive Services Rates	190
Balancing Operating Reserve Determinants	190
Energy Uplift Credits	192
<b>Characteristics of Credits</b>	<b>192</b>
Types of Units	192
Concentration of Energy Uplift Credits	193
Pool Scheduled and Self Scheduled Generation	194
Economic and Noneconomic Generation	194
<b>Geography of Charges and Credits</b>	<b>196</b>
<b>Energy Uplift Issues</b>	<b>197</b>
Lost Opportunity Cost Credits	197
Closed Loop Interfaces	199
Price Setting Logic	201
Confidentiality of Energy Uplift Information	202
<b>Energy Uplift Recommendations</b>	<b>203</b>
Recommendations for Calculation of Credits	203
Recommendations for Allocation of Charges	207
Quantifiable Recommendations Impact	211
<b>Year over Year Energy Uplift Charges Analysis</b>	<b>212</b>

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

<b>PREFACE</b>	<b>I</b>
<b>SECTION 1 INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
2016 in Review	1
PJM Market Summary Statistics	6
PJM Market Background	6
Conclusions	7
Role of MMU	11
Reporting	11
Monitoring	11
Market Design	13
New Recommendations	13
New Recommendations from Section 3, Energy Market	13
New Recommendations from Section 4, Energy Uplift	14
New Recommendations from Section 5, Capacity Market	14
New Recommendation from Section 6, Demand Response	14
New Recommendations from Section 10, Ancillary Service Markets	14
Total Price of Wholesale Power	15
Components of Total Price	15
Section Overviews	19
Overview: Section 3, "Energy Market"	19
Overview: Section 4, "Energy Uplift"	26
Overview: Section 5, "Capacity Market"	31
Overview: Section 6, "Demand Response"	38
Overview: Section 7, "Net Revenue"	42
Overview: Section 8, "Environmental and Renewables"	43
Overview: Section 9, "Interchange Transactions"	46
Overview: Section 10, "Ancillary Services"	49
Overview: Section 11, "Congestion and Marginal Losses"	56
Overview: Section 12, "Planning"	58
Overview: Section 13, "FTRs and ARR"	62
<b>SECTION 2 RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>69</b>
New Recommendations	69
New Recommendations from Section 3, Energy Market	70
New Recommendation from Section 4, Energy Uplift	70
New Recommendations from Section 5, Capacity Market	71
New Recommendation from Section 6, Demand Response	71
New Recommendation from Section 10, Ancillary Service Markets	71
History of MMU Recommendations	71
Complete List of Current MMU Recommendations	72

Section 3, Energy Market	72
Section 4, Energy Uplift	75
Section 5, Capacity	77
Section 6, Demand Response	79
Section 7, Net Revenue	80
Section 8, Environmental	81
Section 9, Interchange Transactions	81
Section 10, Ancillary Services	82
Section 11, Congestion and Marginal Losses	83
Section 12, Planning	83
Section 13, FTRs and ARRs	84
Adopted 2006	85
Adopted 2008	85
Adopted 2009	85
Adopted 2010	86
Adopted 2011	86
Adopted 2012	86
Adopted 2013	86
Adopted 2014	87
Adopted 2015	87
Adopted 2016	89
Adopted Date Not Determined	89
<b>SECTION 3 ENERGY MARKET</b>	<b>91</b>
Overview	92
Market Structure	92
Market Behavior	93
Market Performance	94
Scarcity	95
Recommendations	95
Conclusion	97
Market Structure	99
Market Concentration	99
Ownership of Marginal Resources	101
Type of Marginal Resources	102
Supply	104
Demand	112
Supply and Demand: Load and Spot Market	118
Market Behavior	120
Offer Capping for Local Market Power	120
TPS Test Statistics	123
Parameter Limited Schedules	125
Markup Index	127
Energy Market Cost-Based Offers	131

Frequently Mitigated Units and Associated Units	133
Virtual Offers and Bids	134
Generator Offers	144
<b>Market Performance</b>	<b>146</b>
Markup	146
Prices	154
<b>Scarcity</b>	<b>171</b>
Emergency procedures	171
Scarcity and Scarcity Pricing	174
PJM Cold Weather Operations 2016	178
<b>SECTION 4 ENERGY UPLIFT (OPERATING RESERVES)</b>	<b>179</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>179</b>
Energy Uplift Results	179
Characteristics of Credits	179
Geography of Charges and Credits	179
Energy Uplift Issues	180
Energy Uplift Recommendations	180
Recommendations	180
Conclusion	182
<b>Energy Uplift</b>	<b>183</b>
Credits and Charges Categories	183
<b>Energy Uplift Results</b>	<b>185</b>
Energy Uplift Charges	185
Operating Reserve Rates	188
Reactive Services Rates	190
Balancing Operating Reserve Determinants	190
Energy Uplift Credits	192
<b>Characteristics of Credits</b>	<b>192</b>
Types of Units	192
Concentration of Energy Uplift Credits	193
Pool Scheduled and Self Scheduled Generation	194
Economic and Noneconomic Generation	194
<b>Geography of Charges and Credits</b>	<b>196</b>
<b>Energy Uplift Issues</b>	<b>197</b>
Lost Opportunity Cost Credits	197
Closed Loop Interfaces	199
Price Setting Logic	201
Confidentiality of Energy Uplift Information	202
<b>Energy Uplift Recommendations</b>	<b>203</b>
Recommendations for Calculation of Credits	203
Recommendations for Allocation of Charges	207
Quantifiable Recommendations Impact	211
<b>Year over Year Energy Uplift Charges Analysis</b>	<b>212</b>

<b>SECTION 5 CAPACITY MARKET</b>	<b>213</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>213</b>
RPM Capacity Market	213
Generator Performance	217
Recommendations	217
Conclusion	219
<b>Installed Capacity</b>	<b>222</b>
<b>RPM Capacity Market</b>	<b>224</b>
Market Structure	224
Market Conduct	236
Market Performance	244
<b>Generator Performance</b>	<b>250</b>
Capacity Factor	250
Generator Performance Factors	251
Generator Forced Outage Rates	252
<b>SECTION 6 DEMAND RESPONSE</b>	<b>259</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>259</b>
Recommendations	260
Conclusion	261
<b>PJM Demand Response Programs</b>	<b>263</b>
<b>Participation in Demand Response Programs</b>	<b>264</b>
Economic Program	265
Emergency and Pre-Emergency Programs	271
<b>SECTION 7 NET REVENUE</b>	<b>279</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>279</b>
Net Revenue	279
Historical New Entrant CT and CC Revenue Adequacy	279
Conclusion	280
<b>Net Revenue</b>	<b>280</b>
Spark Spreads, Dark Spreads, and Quark Spreads	281
Theoretical Energy Market Net Revenue	282
Capacity Market Net Revenue	285
<b>Net Revenue Adequacy</b>	<b>285</b>
Levelized Total Costs	286
Levelized Cost of Energy	286
New Entrant Combustion Turbine	286
New Entrant Combined Cycle	288
New Entrant Coal Plant	290
New Entrant Diesel	291
New Entrant Nuclear Plant	292
New Entrant Wind Installation	293

New Entrant Solar Installation	294
<b>Historical New Entrant CT and CC Revenue Adequacy</b>	<b>294</b>
Factors in Net Revenue Adequacy	296
Actual Net Revenue	298
<b>SECTION 8 ENVIRONMENTAL AND RENEWABLE ENERGY REGULATIONS</b>	<b>301</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>301</b>
Federal Environmental Regulation	301
State Environmental Regulation	302
State Renewable Portfolio Standards	302
Emissions Controls in PJM Markets	302
Recommendations	303
Conclusion	303
<b>Federal Environmental Regulation</b>	<b>304</b>
Control of Mercury and Other Hazardous Air Pollutants	304
Air Quality Standards: Control of NO <sub>x</sub> , SO <sub>2</sub> and O <sub>3</sub> Emissions Allowances	304
Emission Standards for Reciprocating Internal Combustion Engines	307
Regulation of Greenhouse Gas Emissions	308
Federal Regulation of Environmental Impacts on Water	309
Federal Regulation of Coal Ash	310
<b>State Environmental Regulation</b>	<b>311</b>
New Jersey High Electric Demand Day (HEDD) Rules	311
Illinois Air Quality Standards (NO <sub>x</sub> , SO <sub>2</sub> and Hg)	312
State Regulation of Greenhouse Gas Emissions	312
State Renewable Portfolio Standards	314
<b>Emissions Controlled Capacity and Renewables in PJM Markets</b>	<b>323</b>
Emission Controlled Capacity in the PJM Region	323
Wind and Solar Peak Hour Output	325
Wind Units	326
Solar Units	327
<b>SECTION 9 INTERCHANGE TRANSACTIONS</b>	<b>329</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>329</b>
Interchange Transaction Activity	329
Interactions with Bordering Areas	329
Recommendations	330
Conclusion	331
<b>Interchange Transaction Activity</b>	<b>332</b>
Charges and Credits Applied to Interchange Transactions	332
Aggregate Imports and Exports	332
Real-Time Interface Imports and Exports	334
Real-Time Interface Pricing Point Imports and Exports	337
Day-Ahead Interface Imports and Exports	340

Day-Ahead Interface Pricing Point Imports and Exports	343
Loop Flows	348
PJM and MISO Interface Prices	355
PJM and NYISO Interface Prices	357
Summary of Interface Prices between PJM and Organized Markets	358
Neptune Underwater Transmission Line to Long Island, New York	359
Linden Variable Frequency Transformer (VFT) facility	360
Hudson Direct Current (DC) Merchant Transmission Line	361
Interchange Activity During High Load Hours	363
<b>Operating Agreements with Bordering Areas</b>	<b>363</b>
PJM and MISO Joint Operating Agreement	364
PJM and New York Independent System Operator Joint Operating Agreement (JOA)	365
PJM and TVA Joint Reliability Coordination Agreement (JRCA)	365
PJM and Duke Energy Progress, Inc. Joint Operating Agreement	366
PJM and VACAR South Reliability Coordination Agreement	368
Balancing Authority Operations Coordination Agreement between Wisconsin Electric Power Company (WEC) and PJM Interconnection, LLC	368
Northeastern ISO-Regional Transmission Organization Planning Coordination Protocol	368
Interface Pricing Agreements with Individual Balancing Authorities	368
Other Agreements with Bordering Areas	369
<b>Interchange Transaction Issues</b>	<b>370</b>
PJM Transmission Loading Relief Procedures (TLRs)	370
Up to Congestion	372
Sham Scheduling	375
Elimination of Ontario Interface Pricing Point	376
PJM and NYISO Coordinated Interchange Transactions	377
Reserving Ramp on the PJM/NYISO Interface	381
PJM and MISO Coordinated Interchange Transaction Proposal	382
Willing to Pay Congestion and Not Willing to Pay Congestion	384
Spot Imports	385
Interchange Optimization	386
Interchange Cap During Emergency Conditions	387
45 Minute Schedule Duration Rule	387
MISO Multi-Value Project Usage Rate ("MUR")	388
<b>SECTION 10 ANCILLARY SERVICE MARKETS</b>	<b>389</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>390</b>
Primary Reserve	390
Tier 1 Synchronized Reserve	390
Tier 2 Synchronized Reserve Market	391
NonSynchronized Reserve Market	391
Secondary Reserve	392

Regulation Market	393
Black Start Service	394
Reactive	395
Ancillary Services Costs per MWh of Load: 1999 through 2016	395
Recommendations	395
Conclusion	396
<b>Primary Reserve</b>	<b>397</b>
Market Structure	397
Price and Cost	400
<b>Tier 1 Synchronized Reserve</b>	<b>401</b>
Market Structure	401
Tier 1 Synchronized Reserve Event Response	403
<b>Tier 2 Synchronized Reserve Market</b>	<b>408</b>
Market Structure	408
Market Behavior	411
Market Performance	412
<b>NonSynchronized Reserve Market</b>	<b>419</b>
Market Structure	419
<b>Secondary Reserve</b>	<b>421</b>
Market Structure	422
Market Conduct	423
Market Performance	424
<b>Regulation Market</b>	<b>427</b>
Market Design	427
Market Structure	437
Market Conduct	441
Market Performance	445
<b>Black Start Service</b>	<b>447</b>
NERC – CIP	449
<b>Reactive Service</b>	<b>450</b>
Recommended Market Approach to Reactive Costs	450
Improvements to Current Approach	452
Reactive Costs	454
<b>SECTION 11 CONGESTION AND MARGINAL LOSSES</b>	<b>457</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>457</b>
Congestion Cost	457
Marginal Loss Cost	458
Energy Cost	459
Conclusion	459
<b>Locational Marginal Price (LMP)</b>	<b>459</b>
Components	459
Hub Components	462

Component Costs	462
<b>Congestion</b>	<b>463</b>
Congestion Accounting	463
Total Congestion	464
<b>Congested Facilities</b>	<b>468</b>
Congestion by Facility Type and Voltage	469
Constraint Duration	472
Constraint Costs	473
Congestion-Event Summary for MISO Flowgates	475
Congestion-Event Summary for NYISO Flowgates	477
Congestion-Event Summary for the 500 kV System	478
Congestion Costs by Physical and Financial Participants	479
Congestion-Event Summary: Impact of Changes in UTC Volumes	480
<b>Marginal Losses</b>	<b>480</b>
Marginal Loss Accounting	480
Total Marginal Loss Cost	482
<b>Energy Costs</b>	<b>486</b>
Energy Accounting	486
Total Energy Costs	486
<b>SECTION 12 GENERATION AND TRANSMISSION PLANNING</b>	<b>491</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>491</b>
Planned Generation and Retirements	491
Generation and Transmission Interconnection Planning Process	491
Regional Transmission Expansion Plan (RTEP)	492
Backbone Facilities	492
Transmission Facility Outages	492
Recommendations	492
Conclusion	494
<b>Planned Generation and Retirements</b>	<b>494</b>
Planned Generation Additions	494
Planned Retirements	497
Generation Mix	501
<b>Generation and Transmission Interconnection Planning Process</b>	<b>502</b>
The Earlier Queue Submittal Task Force	502
Interconnection Study Phase	502
<b>Transmission Facility Outages</b>	<b>512</b>
Scheduling Transmission Facility Outage Requests	512
Rescheduling Transmission Facility Outage Requests	515
Long Duration Transmission Facility Outage Requests	516
Transmission Facility Outage Analysis for the FTR Market	516
Transmission Facility Outage Analysis in the Day-Ahead Energy Market	520

<b>SECTION 13 FINANCIAL TRANSMISSION AND AUCTION REVENUE RIGHTS</b>	<b>523</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>524</b>
Auction Revenue Rights	524
Financial Transmission Rights	525
Markets Timeline	526
Recommendations	526
Conclusion	527
<b>Auction Revenue Rights</b>	<b>530</b>
Market Structure	531
Market Performance	537
<b>Financial Transmission Rights</b>	<b>540</b>
Market Structure	541
Market Performance	544
Revenue Adequacy Issues and Solutions	562
<b>ARRs as an Offset to Congestion for Load</b>	<b>569</b>
FERC Order on FTRs: Balancing Congestion and M2M Payment Allocation	569
<b>Credit Issues</b>	<b>571</b>
<b>FTR Forfeitures</b>	<b>571</b>
Up-to-Congestion Transaction FTR Forfeitures	572



## FIGURES

<b>SECTION 1 INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
Figure 1-1 PJM's footprint and its 20 control zones	7
Figure 1-2 PJM reported monthly billings (\$ Billion): 2008 through 2016	7
Figure 1-3 Top three components of quarterly total price (\$/MWh): 1999 through 2016	19
<b>SECTION 3 ENERGY MARKET</b>	<b>91</b>
Figure 3-1 Fuel source distribution in unit segments: 2016	101
Figure 3-2 PJM hourly energy market HHI: 2016	101
Figure 3-3 Type of fuel used (By real-time marginal units): 2004 through 2016	103
Figure 3-4 Day-ahead marginal up to congestion transaction and generation units: 2014 through 2016	104
Figure 3-5 Average PJM aggregate real-time generation supply curves by offer price: summer of 2015 and 2016	104
Figure 3-6 Fuel diversity index for PJM monthly generation: 2000 through 2016	107
Figure 3-7 Distribution of PJM real-time generation plus imports: January through December, 2015 and 2016	108
Figure 3-8 PJM real-time average monthly hourly generation: 2015 through 2016	108
Figure 3-9 Distribution of PJM day-ahead supply plus imports: 2015 and 2016	109
Figure 3-10 PJM day-ahead monthly average hourly supply: 2015 and 2016	110
Figure 3-11 Day-ahead and real-time supply (Average hourly volumes): 2016	111
Figure 3-12 Difference between day-ahead and real-time supply (Average daily volumes): 2015 and 2016	111
Figure 3-13 Map of PJM real-time generation less real-time load by zone: 2016	112
Figure 3-14 PJM footprint calendar year peak loads: 1999 to 2016	113
Figure 3-15 PJM peak-load comparison Thursday, August 11, 2016 and Tuesday, July 28, 2015	113
Figure 3-16 Distribution of PJM real-time accounting load plus exports: January through December, 2015 and 2016	114
Figure 3-17 PJM real-time monthly average hourly load: January 2015 through December 2016	115
Figure 3-18 PJM heating and cooling degree days: 2015 and 2016	115
Figure 3-19 Distribution of PJM day-ahead demand plus exports: January through December 2015 and 2016	116
Figure 3-20 PJM day-ahead monthly average hourly demand: 2015 and 2016	117
Figure 3-21 Day-ahead and real-time demand (Average hourly volumes): 2016	118
Figure 3-22 Difference between day-ahead and real-time demand (Average daily volumes): 2015 through 2016	118
Figure 3-23 Offers with varying markups at different MW output levels	120
Figure 3-24 Offers with a positive markup but different economic minimum MW	121
Figure 3-25 Dual fuel unit offers	121
Figure 3-26 Real-time offer capped unit statistics: 2015 and 2016	123
Figure 3-27 Frequency distribution of highest markup of gas units offered in 2015 and 2016	129

Figure 3-28 Frequency distribution of highest markup of coal units offered in 2015 and 2016	129
Figure 3-29 Frequency distribution of highest markup of oil units offered in 2015 and 2016	129
Figure 3-30 Cumulative Number of Unit Intervals with markups above \$150 per MWh: 2015 and 2016	130
Figure 3-31 Frequently mitigated units and associated units (By month): February, 2006 through December, 2016	134
Figure 3-32 PJM day-ahead aggregate supply curves: 2016 example day	134
Figure 3-33 Monthly bid and cleared INCs, DECs and UTCs (MW): 2005 through 2016	137
Figure 3-34 Daily bid and cleared INCs, DECs, and UTCs (MW): 2015 through 2016	138
Figure 3-35 PJM monthly cleared up to congestion transactions by type (MW): 2005 through 2016	144
Figure 3-36 PJM daily cleared up to congestion transaction by type (MW): 2015 through 2016	144
Figure 3-37 Markup contribution to real-time hourly load-weighted LMP (Unadjusted): 2015 and 2016	149
Figure 3-38 Markup contribution to real-time hourly load-weighted LMP (Adjusted): 2015 and 2016	149
Figure 3-39 Average LMP for the PJM Real-Time Energy Market: 2015 and 2016	155
Figure 3-40 PJM real-time, load-weighted, average LMP: 2016	157
Figure 3-41 PJM real-time, monthly and annual, load-weighted, average LMP: 1999 through 2016	157
Figure 3-42 PJM real-time, monthly, load-weighted, average LMP and real-time, monthly inflation adjusted load-weighted, average LMP: 1998 through 2016	158
Figure 3-43 Spot average fuel price comparison with fuel delivery charges: 2012 through 2016 (\$/MMBtu)	159
Figure 3-44 Average LMP for the PJM Day-Ahead Energy Market: 2015 and 2016	162
Figure 3-45 Day-ahead, monthly and annual, load-weighted, average LMP: June 2000 through 2016	163
Figure 3-46 PJM day-ahead, monthly, load-weighted, average LMP and day-ahead, monthly inflation adjusted load-weighted, average LMP: June 2000 through 2016	164
Figure 3-47 UTC daily gross profits and losses and net profits: 2016	167
Figure 3-48 Cumulative daily UTC profits: 2013 through 2016	167
Figure 3-49 Real-time hourly LMP minus day-ahead hourly LMP: 2016	170
Figure 3-50 Monthly average of real-time minus day-ahead LMP: 2013 through 2016	170
Figure 3-51 Monthly average of the absolute value of real-time minus day-ahead LMP by pnode: 2013 through 2016	170
Figure 3-52 PJM system hourly average LMP: 2016	170
Figure 3-53 Average daily delivered price for natural gas: 2015 and 2016 (\$/MMBtu)	178

## **SECTION 4 ENERGY UPLIFT (OPERATING RESERVES) 179**

Figure 4-1 Daily day-ahead operating reserve rate (\$/MWh): 2015 and 2016	188
Figure 4-2 Daily balancing operating reserve reliability rates (\$/MWh): 2015 and 2016	189
Figure 4-3 Daily balancing operating reserve deviation rates (\$/MWh): 2015 and 2016	189
Figure 4-4 Daily lost opportunity cost and canceled resources rates (\$/MWh): 2015 and 2016	189
Figure 4-5 Daily reactive transfer interface support rates (\$/MWh): 2015 and 2016	190
Figure 4-6 Cumulative share of energy uplift credits in 2015 and 2016 by unit	193
Figure 4-7 PJM Closed loop interfaces map	200
Figure 4-8 Energy uplift charges change from 2015 to 2016 by category	212

<b>SECTION 5 CAPACITY MARKET</b>	<b>213</b>
Figure 5-1 Percent of PJM installed capacity (By fuel source): June 1, 2007 through June 1, 2019	223
Figure 5-2 Fuel Diversity Index for PJM installed capacity (January 1, 2002 – January 1, 2017)	224
Figure 5-3 Capacity market load obligation served: June 1, 2007 through June 1, 2016	227
Figure 5-4 Map of PJM Locational Deliverability Areas	230
Figure 5-5 Map of PJM RPM EMAAC subzonal LDAs	230
Figure 5-6 Map of PJM RPM ATSI subzonal LDA	230
Figure 5-7 History of PJM capacity prices: 1999/2000 through 2019/2020	248
Figure 5-8 Map of RPM capacity prices: 2016/2017 through 2019/2020	249
Figure 5-9 PJM outages (MW): 2012 through December 2016	251
Figure 5-10 PJM equivalent outage and availability factors: 2007 to 2016	251
Figure 5-11 Trends in the PJM equivalent demand forced outage rate (EFORd): 1999 through 2016	252
Figure 5-12 PJM EFORd, XEFORd and EFORp: 2016	258
Figure 5-13 PJM monthly generator performance factors: 2016	258
<b>SECTION 6 DEMAND RESPONSE</b>	<b>259</b>
Figure 6-1 Demand response revenue by market: 2008 through 2016	265
Figure 6-2 Economic program credits and MWh by month: 2010 through 2016	266
<b>SECTION 7 NET REVENUE</b>	<b>279</b>
Figure 7-1 Energy market net revenue factor trends: 2009 through 2016	281
Figure 7-2 Hourly spark spread (gas) for peak hours (\$/MWh): 2011 through 2016	282
Figure 7-3 Hourly dark spread (coal) for peak hours (\$/MWh): 2011 through 2016	282
Figure 7-4 Hourly quark spread (uranium) for selected zones (\$/MWh): 2011 through 2016	282
Figure 7-5 Average short run marginal costs: 2009 through December 2016	284
Figure 7-6 New entrant CT net revenue and 20-year levelized total cost by LDA (Dollars per installed MW-year): 2009 through 2016	288
Figure 7-7 New entrant CC net revenue and 20-year levelized total cost by LDA (Dollars per installed MW-year): 2009 through 2016	290
Figure 7-8 New entrant CP net revenue and 20-year levelized total cost by LDA (Dollars per installed MW-year): 2009 through 2016	291
Figure 7-9 New entrant NU net revenue and 20-year levelized total cost by LDA (Dollars per installed MW-year): 2009 through 2016	293
Figure 7-10 Historical new entrant CT revenue adequacy: June 2007 through December 2016 and June 2012 through December 2016	295
Figure 7-11 Historical new entrant CC revenue adequacy: June 2007 through December 2016	295

**SECTION 8 ENVIRONMENTAL AND RENEWABLE ENERGY REGULATIONS 301**

Figure 8-1 Spot monthly average emission price comparison: 2015 through 2016	306
Figure 8-2 Map of retail electric load shares under RPS – Tier I resources only: 2016	317
Figure 8-3 Map of retail electric load shares under RPS – Tier I and Tier II resources: 2016	317
Figure 8-4 Average SREC price by jurisdiction: 2009 through 2016	321
Figure 8-5 Average Tier I REC price by jurisdiction: 2009 through 2016	321
Figure 8-6 Average Tier II REC price by jurisdiction: 2009 through 2016	321
Figure 8-7 CO <sub>2</sub> emissions by year (millions of short tons), by PJM units: 1999 through 2016	324
Figure 8-8 CO <sub>2</sub> emissions during on and off peak hours by year (millions of short tons), by PJM units: 1999 through 2016	324
Figure 8-9 SO <sub>2</sub> and NO <sub>x</sub> emissions by year (thousands of short tons), by PJM units: 1999 through 2016	325
Figure 8-10 SO <sub>2</sub> and NO <sub>x</sub> emissions during on and off peak hours by year (thousands of short tons), by PJM units: 1999 through 2016	325
Figure 8-11 Wind and solar output during the top 100 peak load hours in PJM: 2016	326
Figure 8-12 Average hourly real-time generation of wind units in PJM: 2016	326
Figure 8-13 Average hourly day-ahead generation of wind units in PJM: 2016	327
Figure 8-14 Marginal fuel at time of wind generation in PJM: 2016	327
Figure 8-15 Average hourly real-time generation of solar units in PJM: 2016	328
Figure 8-16 Average hourly day-ahead generation of solar units in PJM: 2016	328

**SECTION 9 INTERCHANGE TRANSACTIONS 329**

Figure 9-1 PJM real-time and day-ahead scheduled imports and exports: 2016	333
Figure 9-2 PJM real-time and day-ahead scheduled import and export transaction volume history: 1999 through 2016	334
Figure 9-3 PJM's footprint and its external day-ahead and real-time scheduling interfaces	348
Figure 9-4 Real-time and day-ahead daily hourly average price difference (MISO/PJM Interface minus PJM/MISO Interface): 2016	356
Figure 9-5 Real-time and day-ahead daily hourly average price difference (NY/PJM proxy - PJM/NYIS Interface): 2016	358
Figure 9-6 Neptune hourly average flow: 2016	360
Figure 9-7 Linden hourly average flow: 2016	361
Figure 9-8 Hudson hourly average flow: 2016	362
Figure 9-9 Credits for coordinated congestion management: 2015 and 2016	364
Figure 9-10 Credits for coordinated congestion management (flowgates): 2015 and 2016	365
Figure 9-11 Credits for coordinated congestion management (Ramapo PARs): 2015 and 2016	365
Figure 9-12 Con Edison Protocol	370
Figure 9-13 Monthly up to congestion cleared bids in MWh: 2005 through 2016	372
Figure 9-14 Monthly cleared PJM/NYIS CTS bid volume: November, 2014 through December, 2016	381
Figure 9-15 Spot import service use: 2013 through 2016	386

<b>SECTION 10 ANCILLARY SERVICE MARKETS</b>	<b>389</b>
Figure 10-1 PJM RTO Zone and MAD Subzone geography: 2016	398
Figure 10-2 Mid-Atlantic Dominion Subzone primary reserve MW by source (Daily Averages): 2016	400
Figure 10-3 RTO Reserve Zone primary reserve MW by source (Daily Averages): 2016	400
Figure 10-4 Daily weighted average market clearing prices (\$/MW) for synchronized reserve and nonsynchronized reserve: 2016	401
Figure 10-5 Daily average tier 1 synchronized reserve supply (MW) in the MAD Subzone: 2016	403
Figure 10-6 Comparison of the market clearing prices for synchronized and nonsynchronized reserve in both the RTO Zone and MAD Subzone: 2016	407
Figure 10-7 Cleared tier 2 synchronized reserve average hourly MW per hour by unit type, RTO Zone: 2016	409
Figure 10-8 Average hourly tier 2 MW by unit type by SRMCP range: 2016	409
Figure 10-9 Monthly average actual vs default synchronized reserve requirements, RTO Zone and MAD Subzone: 2015 through 2016	410
Figure 10-10 MAD monthly average tier 2 synchronized reserve scheduled MW: 2015 through 2016	410
Figure 10-11 RTO monthly average tier 2 synchronized reserve scheduled MW: 2015 through 2016	410
Figure 10-12 Tier 2 synchronized reserve hourly offer and eligible volume (MW), averaged daily: 2016	412
Figure 10-13 MAD average daily tier 2 synchronized reserve offer by unit type (MW): 2013 through 2016	412
Figure 10-14 RTO Zone average daily tier 2 synchronized reserve offer by unit type (MW): 2013 through 2016	412
Figure 10-15 Synchronized reserve events duration distribution curve: 2011 through 2016	418
Figure 10-16 Daily average RTO zone nonsynchronized reserve market clearing price and MW purchased: 2016	420
Figure 10-17 Daily average components of DASR clearing price (\$/MW), marginal unit offer and LOC: 2016	426
Figure 10-18 Daily average DASR MW by unit type sorted from highest to lowest daily requirement: 2016	427
Figure 10-19 Hourly average performance score by unit type: 2016	429
Figure 10-20 Hourly average performance score by regulation signal type: 2016	429
Figure 10-21 Daily average marginal benefit factor and mileage ratio during excursion and nonexcursion hours: 2016	431
Figure 10-22 Maximum, minimum, and average PJM calculated marginal benefit factor by month for excursion and nonexcursion hours: 2016	433
Figure 10-23 Marginal benefit factor curve before and after December 14, 2015, revisions by PJM	433
Figure 10-24 Example marginal benefit line in percent RegD and RegD MW terms	435
Figure 10-25 Illustration of correct method for calculating effective MW	435
Figure 10-26 Example of pre and post December 14, 2015, total effective MW calculations for RegD MW offered at \$0.00 or as self supply	436
Figure 10-27 Average monthly peak total effective MW: PJM market calculated versus benefit factor based: 2015 through 2016	436

Figure 10-28 Average cleared RegD MW and average cleared RegD with an effective price of \$0.00 by month: 2015 through 2016	437
Figure 10-29 Cost of excess effective MW cleared by month, peak and off peak: 2015 through 2016	437
Figure 10-30 Off peak and on peak regulation levels: 2015 through 2016	442
Figure 10-31 PJM regulation market daily weighted average market-clearing price, marginal unit opportunity cost and offer price (Dollars per MW): 2016	445
Figure 10-32 PJM monthly CPS1 and BAAL performance: 2011 through 2016	447
<b>SECTION 11 CONGESTION AND MARGINAL LOSSES</b>	<b>457</b>
Figure 11-1 PJM monthly total congestion cost (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2016	467
Figure 11-2 Location of the top 10 constraints by PJM total congestion costs: 2016	474
Figure 11-3 Location of the top 10 constraints by PJM balancing congestion costs: 2016	475
Figure 11-4 Location of the top 10 constraints by PJM day-ahead congestion costs: 2016	475
Figure 11-5 Daily congestion event hours: 2014 through 2016	480
Figure 11-6 PJM monthly marginal loss costs (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2016	484
Figure 11-7 PJM monthly energy costs (Millions): 2009 through 2016	488
<b>SECTION 12 GENERATION AND TRANSMISSION PLANNING</b>	<b>491</b>
Figure 12-1 Map of PJM unit retirements: 2011 through 2020	498
Figure 12-2 PJM capacity (MW) by age (years): At December 31, 2016	501
Figure 12-3 Queue Project MW by Fuel Type and queue entry year: January 1, 1997 through December 31, 2016	506
Figure 12-4 Illustration of day-ahead market analysis on November 22, 2016	521
Figure 12-5 Weekly average number of approved or active outage requests comparing day-ahead market model outages: 2015 and 2016	521
Figure 12-6 Weekly average number of day-ahead market model outages comparing outages occurred on operating day: 2015 and 2016	521
Figure 12-7 Weekly average number of approved or active outage requests comparing outages occurred on operating day: 2015 and 2016	522
<b>SECTION 13 FINANCIAL TRANSMISSION AND AUCTION REVENUE RIGHTS</b>	<b>523</b>
Equation 13- 1 Calculation of prorated ARR	533
Figure 13-1 Historic Stage 1B and Stage 2 ARR Allocations from the 2011 to 2012 through 2016 to 2017 planning periods	534
Figure 13-2 Stage 1A Infeasibility Funding Impact	538
Figure 13-3 Overallocated Stage 1A ARR source points	538
Figure 13-4 Dollars per ARR MW paid to ARR holders: Planning periods 2010 to 2011 through 2016 to 2017	539
Figure 13-5 Monthly excess ARR revenue: Planning periods 2011 to 2012 through 2016 to 2017	539
Figure 13-6 Annual Bid FTR Auction volume: Planning period 2009 to 2010 through 2016 to 2017	546
Figure 13-7 Annual Cleared FTR Auction volume: Planning period 2009 to 2010 through 2016 to 2017	547

Figure 13-8 Cleared auction volume (MW) as a percent of total FTR cleared volume by calendar month: June 2004 through December 2016	549
Figure 13-9 Long Term, Annual and Monthly FTR Auction bid and cleared volume: June 2003 through December 2016	550
Figure 13-10 Annual FTR Auction volume-weighted average buy bid price: Planning period 2009 to 2010 through 2016 to 2017	551
Figure 13-11 Ten largest positive and negative FTR target allocations summed by sink: 2016 to 2017 planning period	557
Figure 13-12 Ten largest positive and negative FTR target allocations summed by source: 2016 to 2017 planning period	557
Figure 13-13 FTR payout ratio by month, excluding and including excess revenue distribution: January 2004 through December 2016	561
Figure 13-14 FTR surplus and the collected day-ahead, balancing and total congestion: January 2005 through December 2016	568
Figure 13-15 FTR target allocation compared to sources of positive and negative congestion revenue	568
Figure 13-16 Illustration of INC/DEC FTR forfeiture rule	571
Figure 13-17 Monthly FTR forfeitures for physical and financial participants: June 2010 through December 2016	572
Figure 13-18 FTR forfeitures for INCs/DECs and INCs/DECs/UTCs for both the PJM and MMU methods: January 2013 through December 2016	572
Figure 13-19 Illustration of UTC FTR forfeiture rule	573
Figure 13-20 Illustration of UTC FTR Forfeiture rule with one point far from constraint	573



## TABLES

---

<b>SECTION 1 INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
Table 1-1 PJM Market Summary Statistics: 2015 and 2016	6
Table 1-2 The Energy Market results were competitive	8
Table 1-3 The Capacity Market results were competitive	9
Table 1-4 The Tier 2 Synchronized Reserve Market results were competitive	10
Table 1-5 The Day-Ahead Scheduling Reserve Market results were competitive	10
Table 1-6 The Regulation Market results were competitive	10
Table 1-7 The FTR Auction Markets results were competitive	11
Table 1-8 Total price per MWh by category: 2015 and 2016	16
Table 1-9 Total price per MWh by category: Calendar Years 1999 through 2016	17
Table 1-10 Percent of total price per MWh by category: Calendar Years 1999 through 2016	18
<b>SECTION 2 RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>69</b>
Table 2-1 Status of MMU reported recommendations: 1999 through 2016	72
<b>SECTION 3 ENERGY MARKET</b>	<b>91</b>
Table 3-1 The energy market results were competitive	91
Table 3-2 PJM hourly energy market HHI: 2015 and 2016	100
Table 3-3 PJM hourly energy market HHI (By supply segment): 2015 and 2016	100
Table 3-4 Marginal unit contribution to PJM real-time, load-weighted LMP (By parent company): 2015 and 2016	102
Table 3-5 Marginal resource contribution to PJM day-ahead, load-weighted LMP (By parent company): 2015 and 2016	102
Table 3-6 Type of fuel used (By real-time marginal units): 2012 through 2016	103
Table 3-7 Day-ahead marginal resources by type/fuel: 2011 through 2016	104
Table 3-8 PJM generation (By fuel source (GWh)): 2015 and 2016	105
Table 3-9 Monthly PJM generation (By fuel source (GWh)): 2016	106
Table 3-10 PJM real-time average hourly generation and real-time average hourly generation plus average hourly imports: 2000 through 2016	108
Table 3-11 PJM day-ahead average hourly supply and day-ahead average hourly supply plus average hourly imports: 2000 through 2016	110
Table 3-12 Day-ahead and real-time supply (MW): 2015 and 2016	111
Table 3-13 PJM real-time generation less real-time load by zone (GWh): 2015 and 2016	112
Table 3-14 Actual PJM footprint peak loads: 1999 to 2016	113
Table 3-15 PJM real-time average hourly load and real-time average hourly load plus average hourly exports: January through December, 1998 through 2016	114
Table 3-16 PJM heating and cooling degree days: 2015 and 2016	115
Table 3-17 PJM day-ahead average demand and day-ahead average hourly demand plus average hourly exports: 2000 through 2016	117
Table 3-18 Cleared day-ahead and real-time demand (MWh): 2015 and 2016	118

Table 3-19 Monthly average percent of real-time self-supply load, bilateral-supply load and spot-supply load based on parent companies: 2015 through 2016	119
Table 3-20 Monthly average share of day-ahead self-supply demand, bilateral supply demand, and spot-supply demand based on parent companies: 2015 through 2016	120
Table 3-21 Offer capping statistics – energy only: 2012 to 2016	121
Table 3-22 Offer capping statistics for energy and reliability: 2012 to 2016	122
Table 3-23 Offer capping statistics for reliability: 2012 to 2016	122
Table 3-24 Real-time offer capped unit statistics: 2015 and 2016	123
Table 3-25 Numbers of hours when control zones experienced congestion resulting from one or more constraints binding for 100 or more hours or from an interface constraint: 2009 through 2016	123
Table 3-26 Three pivotal supplier test details for interface constraints: 2016	124
Table 3-27 Summary of three pivotal supplier tests applied for interface constraints: 2016	124
Table 3-28 Average, real-time marginal unit markup index (By offer price category unadjusted): 2015 and 2016	128
Table 3-29 Average, real-time marginal unit markup index (By offer price category adjusted): 2015 and 2016	128
Table 3-30 Percent of marginal units with markup below, above and equal to zero (by fuel type unadjusted): 2015 and 2016	129
Table 3-31 Percent of marginal units with markup below, above and equal to zero (by fuel type adjusted): 2015 and 2016	129
Table 3-32 Average day-ahead marginal unit markup index (By offer price category, unadjusted): 2015 and 2016	130
Table 3-33 Average day-ahead marginal unit markup index (By offer price category, adjusted): 2015 and 2016	131
Table 3-34 Hourly average number of cleared and submitted INCs, DECs by month: 2015 and 2016	135
Table 3-35 Hourly average of cleared and submitted up to congestion bids by month: 2015 and 2016	136
Table 3-36 Hourly average day-ahead number of cleared and submitted import and export transactions by month: 2015 and 2016	136
Table 3-37 Type of day-ahead marginal units: 2015 and 2016	137
Table 3-38 PJM INC and DEC bids and cleared MW by type of parent organization (MW): 2015 and 2016	138
Table 3-39 PJM up to congestion transactions by type of parent organization (MW): 2015 and 2016	138
Table 3-40 PJM import and export transactions by type of parent organization (MW): 2015 and 2016	138
Table 3-41 PJM virtual offers and bids by top ten locations (MW): 2015 and 2016	139
Table 3-42 PJM cleared up to congestion import bids by top ten source and sink pairs (MW): 2015 and 2016	139
Table 3-43 PJM cleared up to congestion export bids by top ten source and sink pairs (MW): 2015 and 2016	140
Table 3-44 PJM cleared up to congestion wheel bids by top ten source and sink pairs (MW): 2015 and 2016	141
Table 3-45 PJM cleared up to congestion internal bids by top ten source and sink pairs (MW): 2015 and 2016	142

Table 3-46 Number of PJM offered and cleared source and sink pairs: 2013 through 2016	143
Table 3-47 PJM cleared up to congestion transactions by type (MW): 2015 and 2016	144
Table 3-48 Distribution of MW for dispatchable unit offer prices: 2016	145
Table 3-49 Distribution of MW for self scheduled and dispatchable unit offer prices: 2016	146
Table 3-50 Markup component of the overall PJM real-time, load-weighted, average LMP by primary fuel type and unit type: 2015 and 2016	147
Table 3-51 Monthly markup components of real-time load-weighted LMP (Unadjusted): 2015 and 2016	148
Table 3-52 Monthly markup components of real-time load-weighted LMP (Adjusted): 2015 and 2016	148
Table 3-53 Average real-time zonal markup component (Unadjusted): 2015 and 2016	150
Table 3-54 Average real-time zonal markup component (Adjusted): 2015 and 2016	150
Table 3-55 Average real-time markup component (By price category, unadjusted): 2015 and 2016	151
Table 3-56 Average real-time markup component (By price category, adjusted): 2015 and 2016	151
Table 3-57 Markup component of the annual PJM day-ahead, load-weighted, average LMP by primary fuel type and unit type: 2015 and 2016	152
Table 3-58 Monthly markup components of day-ahead (Unadjusted), load-weighted LMP: 2015 and 2016	152
Table 3-59 Monthly markup components of day-ahead (Adjusted), load-weighted LMP: 2015 and 2016	153
Table 3-60 Day-ahead, average, zonal markup component (Unadjusted): 2015 and 2016	153
Table 3-61 Day-ahead, average, zonal markup component (Adjusted): 2015 and 2016	154
Table 3-62 Average, day-ahead markup (By LMP category, unadjusted): 2015 and 2016	154
Table 3-63 Average, day-ahead markup (By LMP category, adjusted): 2015 and 2016	154
Table 3-64 PJM real-time, average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 1998 through 2016	155
Table 3-65 PJM real-time, load-weighted, average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 1998 through 2016	156
Table 3-66 Zone real-time and real-time, load-weighted, average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 2015 and 2016	156
Table 3-67 PJM real-time, yearly, load-weighted, average LMP and real-time, yearly inflation adjusted load-weighted, average LMP: 1998 through 2016	158
Table 3-68 PJM real-time annual, fuel-cost adjusted, load-weighted average LMP (Dollars per MWh): year over year	159
Table 3-69 Change in PJM real-time annual, fuel-cost adjusted, load-weighted average LMP (Dollars per MWh) by fuel type: year over year	159
Table 3-70 Components of PJM real-time (Unadjusted), load-weighted, average LMP: 2015 and 2016	161
Table 3-71 Components of PJM real-time (Adjusted), load-weighted, average LMP: 2015 and 2016	161
Table 3-72 Frequency and average shadow price of transmission constraints in PJM: 2015 and 2016	162
Table 3-73 PJM day-ahead, average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 2001 through 2016	162
Table 3-74 PJM day-ahead, load-weighted, average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 2001 through 2016	163
Table 3-75 Zone day-ahead and day-ahead, load-weighted, average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 2015 and 2016	163
Table 3-76 PJM day-ahead, yearly, load-weighted, average LMP and day-ahead, yearly inflation adjusted load-weighted, average LMP: 2000 through 2016	164

Table 3-77 Components of PJM day-ahead, (unadjusted), load-weighted, average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 2015 and 2016	165
Table 3-78 Components of PJM day-ahead, (adjusted), load-weighted, average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 2015 and 2016	165
Table 3-79 Cleared UTC profitability by source and sink point: 2015 and 2016	166
Table 3-80 UTC profits by month: 2013 through 2016	167
Table 3-81 Day-ahead and real-time average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 2015 and 2016	168
Table 3-82 Day-ahead and real-time average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 2001 through 2016	168
Table 3-83 Frequency distribution by hours of PJM real-time LMP minus day-ahead LMP (Dollars per MWh): 2007 through 2016	169
Table 3-84 Summary of emergency events declared: 2015 and 2016	171
Table 3-85 Description of emergency procedures	173
Table 3-86 PJM declared emergency alerts, warnings and actions: 2016	174
Table 3-87 Performance of synchronized reserves during spinning events: 2015 and 2016	177
<b>SECTION 4 ENERGY UPLIFT (OPERATING RESERVES)</b>	<b>179</b>
Table 4-1 Day-ahead and balancing operating reserve credits and charges	184
Table 4-2 Reactive services, synchronous condensing and black start services credits and charges	184
Table 4-3 Total energy uplift charges: 2001 through 2016	185
Table 4-4 Energy uplift charges by category: 2015 and 2016	185
Table 4-5 Monthly energy uplift charges: 2015 and 2016	186
Table 4-6 Day-ahead operating reserve charges: 2015 and 2016	186
Table 4-7 Balancing operating reserve charges: 2015 and 2016	186
Table 4-8 Balancing operating reserve deviation charges: 2015 and 2016	187
Table 4-9 Additional energy uplift charges: 2015 and 2016	187
Table 4-10 Regional balancing charges allocation (Millions): 2015	188
Table 4-11 Regional balancing charges allocation (Millions): 2016	188
Table 4-12 Operating reserve rates (\$/MWh): 2015 and 2016	189
Table 4-13 Operating reserve rates statistics (\$/MWh): 2016	190
Table 4-14 Local voltage support rates: 2015 and 2016	190
Table 4-15 Balancing operating reserve determinants (MWh): 2015 and 2016	191
Table 4-16 Deviations by transaction type: 2016	191
Table 4-17 Energy uplift credits by category: 2015 and 2016	192
Table 4-18 Energy uplift credits by unit type: 2015 and 2016	192
Table 4-19 Energy uplift credits by unit type: 2016	193
Table 4-20 Top 10 units and organizations energy uplift credits: 2016	193
Table 4-21 Identification of balancing operating reserve credits received by the top 10 units by category and region: 2016	193
Table 4-22 Daily energy uplift credits HHI: 2016	194
Table 4-23 Day-ahead and real-time generation commitment status percent: 2016	194
Table 4-24 Day-ahead and real-time generation (GWh): 2016	195

Table 4-25 Day-ahead and real-time economic and noneconomic generation from units eligible for operating reserve credits (GWh): 2016	195
Table 4-26 Day-ahead and real-time generation receiving operating reserve credits (GWh): 2016	195
Table 4-27 Day-ahead generation scheduled as must run by PJM (GWh): 2015 and 2016	196
Table 4-28 Day-ahead generation scheduled as must run by PJM by category (GWh): 2016	196
Table 4-29 Geography of regional charges and credits: 2016	197
Table 4-30 Monthly lost opportunity cost credits (Millions): 2015 and 2016	198
Table 4-31 Day-ahead generation from combustion turbines and diesels (GWh): 2015 and 2016	198
Table 4-32 Lost opportunity cost credits paid to combustion turbines and diesels by scenario (Millions): 2015 and 2016	199
Table 4-33 Day-ahead generation (GWh) from combustion turbines and diesels receiving lost opportunity cost credits by value: 2015 and 2016	199
Table 4-34 PJM closed loop interfaces	200
Table 4-35 Current energy uplift allocation	210
Table 4-36 MMU energy uplift allocation proposal	210
Table 4-37 Current and proposed energy uplift charges by allocation (Millions): 2015 and 2016	211
Table 4-38 Current and proposed average energy uplift rate by transaction: 2015 and 2016	212
<b>SECTION 5 CAPACITY MARKET</b>	<b>213</b>
Table 5-1 The capacity market results were competitive	213
Table 5-2 RPM related MMU reports, 2015 through 2016	221
Table 5-2 RPM related MMU reports, 2015 through 2016 (continued)	222
Table 5-3 PJM installed capacity (By fuel source): January 1, May 31, June 1, and December 31, 2016	223
Table 5-4 Generation capacity changes: 2007/2008 to 2016/2017	226
Table 5-5 Internal capacity: June 1, 2015 to June 1, 2019	226
Table 5-6 Capacity market load obligations served: June 1, 2016	227
Table 5-7 RSI results: 2016/2017 through 2019/2020 RPM Auctions	229
Table 5-8 PJM capacity summary (MW): June 1, 2007 to June 1, 2019	232
Table 5-9 RPM imports: 2007/2008 through 2019/2020 RPM Base Residual Auctions	233
Table 5-10 RPM load management statistics by LDA: June 1, 2015 to June 1, 2019	235
Table 5-11 RPM load management cleared capacity and ILR: 2007/2008 through 2019/2020	235
Table 5-12 RPM load management statistics: June 1, 2007 to June 1, 2019	236
Table 5-13 ACR statistics: 2016/2017 RPM Auctions	241
Table 5-14 ACR Statistics: 2017/2018 RPM Auctions	241
Table 5-15 ACR Statistics: 2018/2019 RPM Auctions	242
Table 5-16 ACR Statistics: 2019/2020 RPM Auctions	242
Table 5-17 APIR Statistics: 2016/2017 RPM Base Residual Auction	243
Table 5-18 APIR Statistics: 2017/2018 RPM Base Residual Auction	243
Table 5-19 APIR Statistics: 2018/2019 RPM Base Residual Auction	243
Table 5-20 APIR Statistics: 2019/2020 RPM Base Residual Auction	244
Table 5-21 Capacity prices: 2007/2008 through 2019/2020 RPM Auctions	245
Table 5-21 Capacity prices: 2007/2008 through 2019/2020 RPM Auctions (continued)	246

Table 5-22 Weighted average clearing prices by zone: 2016/2017 through 2019/2020	246
Table 5-23 RPM revenue by type: 2007/2008 through 2019/2020	247
Table 5-24 RPM revenue by calendar year: 2007 through 2020	248
Table 5-25 RPM cost to load: 2015/2016 through 2019/2020 RPM Auctions	250
Table 5-26 PJM capacity factor (By unit type (GWh)): January through December, 2015 and 2016	250
Table 5-27 EFOF, EPOF, EMOF and EAF by unit type: 2007 through 2016	252
Table 5-28 PJM EFORd data for different unit types: 2007 through 2016	253
Table 5-29 OMC outages: 2016	254
Table 5-30 Contribution to EFOF by unit type by cause: 2016	257
Table 5-31 Contributions to Economic Outages: 2016	257
Table 5-32 PJM EFORd, XEFORd and EFORp data by unit type: 2016	258
<b>SECTION 6 DEMAND RESPONSE</b>	<b>259</b>
Table 6-1 Overview of demand response programs	264
Table 6-2 Economic program registrations on the last day of the month: January 2010 through December 2016	265
Table 6-3 Sum of peak MW reductions for all registrations per month: 2010 through 2016	265
Table 6-4 Credits paid to the PJM economic program participants: 2010 through 2016	266
Table 6-5 PJM economic program participation by zone: 2015 and 2016	267
Table 6-6 Settlements submitted by year in the economic program: 2010 through 2016	267
Table 6-7 Participants and CSPs submitting settlements in the economic program by year: 2010 through 2016	267
Table 6-8 HHI and market concentration in the economic program: January 2015 through December 2016	267
Table 6-9 Hourly frequency distribution of economic program MWh reductions and credits: 2015 and 2016	268
Table 6-10 Frequency distribution of economic program zonal, load-weighted, average LMP (By hours): 2015 and 2016	268
Table 6-11 Net benefits test threshold prices: April 2012 through December 2016	269
Table 6-12 Hours with price higher than NBT and DR occurrences in those hours: 2015 and 2016	269
Table 6-13 Zonal DR charge: 2016	270
Table 6-14 Zonal DR charge per MWh of load and exports: 2016	270
Table 6-15 Monthly day-ahead and real-time DR charge: 2015 and 2016	271
Table 6-16 HHI value for LDAs by delivery year: 2015/2016 and 2016/2017 Delivery Year	271
Table 6-17 Zonal monthly capacity revenue: 2016	272
Table 6-18 Energy efficiency resources by MW: 2012/2013 through 2016/2017 Delivery Year	272
Table 6-19 Lead time by product type: 2015/2016 Delivery Year	273
Table 6-20 Lead time by product type: 2016/2017 Delivery Year	273
Table 6-21 Reduction MW by each demand response method: 2015/2016 Delivery Year	273
Table 6-22 Reduction MW by each demand response method: 2016/2017 Delivery Year	274
Table 6-23 On-site generation fuel type by MW: 2015/2016 and 2016/2017 Delivery Years	274

Table 6-24 Demand response cleared MW UCAP for PJM: 2011/2012 through 2016/2017 Delivery Year	274
Table 6-25 Distribution of registrations and associated MW in the emergency full option across ranges of minimum dispatch prices: 2015/2016 Delivery Year	278
Table 6-26 Distribution of registrations and associated MW in the emergency full option across ranges of minimum dispatch prices: 2016/2017 Delivery Year	278
<b>SECTION 7 NET REVENUE</b>	<b>279</b>
Table 7-1 Peak hour spreads (\$/MWh): 2011 through 2016	281
Table 7-2 Peak hour spread standard deviation (\$/MWh): 2011 through 2016	281
Table 7-3 New entrant ancillary service revenue (Dollars per MW-year)	283
Table 7-4 Average short run marginal costs: 2016	283
Table 7-5 Average run hours: 2009 through 2016	284
Table 7-6 Capacity revenue by PJM zones (Dollars per MW-year): 2009 through 2016	285
Table 7-7 New entrant 20-year levelized total costs (By plant type (Dollars per installed MW-year))	286
Table 7-8 Levelized cost of energy: 2016	286
Table 7-9 Energy net revenue for a new entrant gas fired CT under economic dispatch (Dollars per installed MW-year)	287
Table 7-10 Percent of 20-year levelized total costs recovered by CT energy and capacity net revenue	287
Table 7-11 Energy net revenue for a new entrant CC under economic dispatch (Dollars per installed MW-year)	289
Table 7-12 Percent of 20-year levelized total costs recovered by CC energy and capacity net revenue	289
Table 7-13 Energy net revenue for a new entrant CP (Dollars per installed MW-year)	291
Table 7-14 Percent of 20-year levelized total costs recovered by CP energy and capacity net revenue	291
Table 7-15 Energy market net revenue for a new entrant DS (Dollars per installed MW-year)	292
Table 7-16 Percent of 20-year levelized total costs recovered by DS energy and capacity net revenue	292
Table 7-17 Energy net revenue for a new entrant nuclear plant (Dollars per installed MW-year)	293
Table 7-18 Percent of 20-year levelized total costs recovered by nuclear energy and capacity net revenue: 2009 through 2016	293
Table 7-19 Net revenue for a wind installation (Dollars per installed MW-year)	294
Table 7-20 Percent of 20-year levelized total costs recovered by wind net revenue (Dollars per installed MW-year): 2012 through 2016	294
Table 7-21 PSEG net revenue for a solar installation (Dollars per installed MW-year)	294
Table 7-22 Percent of 20-year levelized total costs recovered by solar net revenue (Dollars per installed MW-year)	294
Table 7-23 Assumptions for analysis of new entry	296
Table 7-24 Internal rate of return sensitivity for CT, CC and CP generators	297
Table 7-25 Debt to equity ratio sensitivity for CT and CC assuming 20 year debt term and 12 percent internal rate of return	297
Table 7-26 Debt term sensitivity for CT and CC assuming 50/50 debt to equity ratio and 12 percent internal rate of return	297
Table 7-27 Interconnection cost sensitivity for CT and CC	298
Table 7-28 Net revenue by quartile for select technologies: 2016	299

Table 7-29 Avoidable cost recovery by quartile: 2016	300
Table 7-30 Proportion of units recovering avoidable costs: 2011 through 2016	300
Table 7-31 Profile of units at risk of retirement	300
<b>SECTION 8 ENVIRONMENTAL AND RENEWABLE ENERGY REGULATIONS</b>	<b>301</b>
Table 8-1 Current and proposed CSAPR ozone season NO <sub>x</sub> budgets for electric generating units (before accounting for variability)	306
Table 8-2 Interim and final targets for CO <sub>2</sub> emissions goals for PJM states (Short Tons of CO <sub>2</sub> )	309
Table 8-3 Minimum criteria for existing CCR ponds (surface impoundments) and landfills and date by which implementation is expected	311
Table 8-4 HEDD maximum NO <sub>x</sub> emission rates	312
Table 8-5 RGGI CO <sub>2</sub> allowance auction prices and quantities in short tons and metric tonnes: 2009-2011, 2012-2014 and 2015-2017 Compliance Periods	313
Table 8-6 Renewable standards of PJM jurisdictions: 2016 to 2028	315
Table 8-7 Additional renewable standards of PJM jurisdictions: 2016 to 2028	316
Table 8-8 Solar renewable standards by percent of electric load for PJM jurisdictions: 2016 to 2028	316
Table 8-9 Renewable resource generation by jurisdiction and renewable resource type (GWh): 2016	318
Table 8-10 PJM renewable capacity by jurisdiction (MW): December 31, 2016	318
Table 8-11 Renewable capacity by jurisdiction, non-PJM units registered in GATS (MW), on December 31, 2016	319
Table 8-12 REC Tracking systems in PJM states with renewable portfolio standards	320
Table 8-13 Geographic restrictions on REC purchases for renewable portfolio standard compliance in PJM states	320
Table 8-14 Renewable alternative compliance payments in PJM jurisdictions: As of December 31, 2016	322
Table 8-15 SO <sub>2</sub> emission controls by fuel type (MW): as of December 31, 2016	323
Table 8-16 NO <sub>x</sub> emission controls by fuel type (MW), as of December 31, 2016	323
Table 8-17 Particulate emission controls by fuel type (MW), as of December 31, 2016	323
Table 8-18 Capacity factor of wind units in PJM: 2016	326
Table 8-19 Capacity factor of wind units in PJM by month: 2015 through 2016	326
Table 8-20 Capacity factor of wind units in PJM: 2016	327
Table 8-21 Capacity factor of solar units in PJM by month: 2015 through 2016	328
<b>SECTION 9 INTERCHANGE TRANSACTIONS</b>	<b>329</b>
Table 9-1 Charges and Credits Applied to Interchange Transactions	332
Table 9-2 Real-time scheduled net interchange volume by interface (GWh): 2016	335
Table 9-3 Real-time scheduled gross import volume by interface (GWh): 2016	336
Table 9-4 Real-time scheduled gross export volume by interface (GWh): 2016	336
Table 9-5 Real-time scheduled net interchange volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2016	338
Table 9-6 Real-time scheduled gross import volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2016	339
Table 9-7 Real-time scheduled gross export volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2016	339
Table 9-8 Day-Ahead scheduled net interchange volume by interface (GWh): 2016	341

Table 9-9 Day-Ahead scheduled gross import volume by interface (GWh): 2016	342
Table 9-10 Day-Ahead scheduled gross export volume by interface (GWh): 2016	342
Table 9-11 Day-ahead scheduled net interchange volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2016	344
Table 9-12 Up to congestion scheduled net interchange volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2016	345
Table 9-13 Day-ahead scheduled gross import volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2016	345
Table 9-14 Up to congestion scheduled gross import volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2016	346
Table 9-15 Day-ahead scheduled gross export volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2016	346
Table 9-16 Up to congestion scheduled gross export volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2016	347
Table 9-17 Active real-time and day-ahead scheduling interfaces: 2016	347
Table 9-18 Active day-ahead and real-time scheduled interface pricing points: 2016	348
Table 9-19 Net scheduled and actual PJM flows by interface (GWh): 2016	349
Table 9-20 Net scheduled and actual PJM flows by interface pricing point (GWh): 2016	350
Table 9-21 Net scheduled and actual PJM flows by interface pricing point (GWh) (Adjusted for IMO Scheduled Interfaces): 2016	351
Table 9-22 Net scheduled and actual PJM flows by interface and interface pricing point (GWh): 2016	352
Table 9-23 Net scheduled and actual PJM flows by interface pricing point and interface (GWh): 2016	353
Table 9-24 PJM and MISO flow based hours and average hourly price differences: 2016	356
Table 9-25 Distribution of hourly flows that are consistent and inconsistent with price differences between PJM and MISO: 2016	357
Table 9-26 PJM and NYISO flow based hours and average hourly price differences: 2016	358
Table 9-27 Distribution of hourly flows that are consistent and inconsistent with price differences between PJM and NYISO: 2016	358
Table 9-28 PJM, NYISO and MISO real-time and day-ahead border price averages: 2016	359
Table 9-29 PJM and NYISO flow based hours and average hourly price differences (Neptune): 2016	359
Table 9-30 Percent of scheduled interchange across the Neptune line by primary rights holder: July, 2007 through December, 2016	360
Table 9-31 PJM and NYISO flow based hours and average hourly price differences (Linden): 2016	360
Table 9-32 Percent of scheduled interchange across the Linden VFT Line by primary rights holder: November, 2009 through December, 2016	361
Table 9-33 PJM and NYISO flow based hours and average hourly price differences (Hudson): 2016	362
Table 9-34 Percent of scheduled interchange across the Hudson Line by primary rights holder: May, 2013 through December, 2016	362
Table 9-35 Summary of elements included in operating agreements with bordering areas	363
Table 9-36 Real-time average hourly LMP comparison for Duke, PEC and NCMPA: 2016	369
Table 9-37 Day-ahead average hourly LMP comparison for Duke, PEC and NCMPA: 2016	369
Table 9-38 PJM MISO, and NYISO TLR procedures: 2013 through 2016	371
Table 9-39 Number of TLRs by TLR level by reliability coordinator: 2016	372
Table 9-40 Monthly volume of cleared and submitted up to congestion bids: 2015 and 2016	373
Table 9-41 Credit risk associated with varying levels of potential uplift: September 8, 2014 through December 7, 2015	374
Table 9-42 Differences between forecast and actual PJM/NYIS interface prices: 2016	377

Table 9-43 Differences between forecast and actual PJM/NYIS interface prices: 2016	378
Table 9-44 Monthly Differences between forecast and actual PJM/NYIS interface prices (percent of intervals): 2016	379
Table 9-45 Monthly differences between forecast and actual PJM/NYIS interface prices (average price difference): 2016	380
Table 9-46 Differences between forecast and actual PJM/MISO interface prices: 2016	382
Table 9-47 Differences between forecast and actual PJM/MISO interface prices: 2016	382
Table 9-48 Monthly Differences between forecast and actual PJM/MISO interface prices (percent of intervals): 2016	383
Table 9-49 Monthly differences between forecast and actual PJM/MISO interface prices (average price difference): 2016	384
Table 9-50 Monthly uncollected congestion charges: 2010 through 2016	385
Table 9-51 MISO Projected Multi Value Project Usage Rate: 2017 through 2036	388

## **SECTION 10 ANCILLARY SERVICE MARKETS** **389**

---

Table 10-1 The Tier 2 Synchronized Reserve Market results were competitive	389
Table 10-2 The Day-Ahead Scheduling Reserve Market results were competitive	389
Table 10-3 The Regulation Market results were competitive	389
Table 10-4 History of ancillary services costs per MWh of Load: 1999 through 2016	395
Table 10-5 Average monthly reserves used to satisfy the primary reserve requirement, MAD Subzone: 2016	399
Table 10-6 Average monthly reserves used to satisfy the primary reserve requirement, RTO Zone: 2016	399
Table 10-7 MW credited, price, cost, and all-in price for primary reserve and its component products, RTO Reserve Zone: 2016	401
Table 10-8 Monthly average market solution Tier 1 Synchronized Reserve (MW) identified hourly: 2016	402
Table 10-9 Tier 1 synchronized reserve event response costs: 2015 through 2016	404
Table 10-10 Weighted price of tier 1 synchronized reserve attributable to a nonsynchronized reserve price above zero: 2015 through 2016	405
Table 10-11 Payments to tier 1 synchronized reserve when the NSRMCP goes above \$0: 2015 through 2016	406
Table 10-12 Tier 1 compensation as currently implemented by PJM	406
Table 10-13 Tier 1 compensation as recommended by MMU	406
Table 10-14 RTO Zone ASO tier 1 estimate biasing: 2015 through 2016	407
Table 10-15 Default Tier 2 Synchronized Reserve Markets required MW, RTO Zone and Mid-Atlantic Dominion Subzone	409
Table 10-16 Three pivotal supplier test results for the RTO Zone and MAD Subzone: 2015 and 2016	411
Table 10-17 Mid-Atlantic Dominion subzone, weighted average SRMCP and average scheduled, tier 1 estimated and demand response MW: 2015 through 2016	413
Table 10-18 RTO zone weighted average SRMCP and average scheduled, tier 1 estimated and demand response MW: 2015 through 2016	414
Table 10-19 RTO Zone, Mid-Atlantic Subzone tier 2 synchronized reserve MW, credits, weighted price, and cost (including self-scheduled): 2016	415

Table 10-20 Synchronized reserve events 10 minutes or longer, tier 2 response compliance, RTO Reserve Zone: 2016	416
Table 10-21 Synchronized reserve events: January 2010 through December 2016	417
Table 10-21 Synchronized reserve events: January 2010 through December 2016 (continued)	418
Table 10-22 Nonsynchronized reserve market HHIs: 2016	420
Table 10-23 Nonsynchronized reserve market pivotal supply test: 2016	420
Table 10-24 RTO zone, MAD subzone nonsynchronized reserve MW, charges, price, and cost: 2016	421
Table 10-25 Adjusted Fixed Demand Days: 2016	423
Table 10-26 DASR market three pivotal supplier test results and number of hours with DASRMCP above \$0: 2015 through 2016	423
Table 10-27 DASR Market, regular hours vs. adjusted fixed demand hours: 2015 and 2016	425
Table 10-28 DASR Market all hours of DASR market clearing price greater than \$0: 2015 through 2016	426
Table 10-29 Average monthly price paid per effective MW of RegD and RegA under mileage and MRTS based settlement: 2015 through 2016.	432
Table 10-30 MBF assumed RegD proportions versus market solution realized RegD proportions	434
Table 10-31 PJM regulation capability, daily offer and hourly eligible: 2016	438
Table 10-32 PJM regulation by source: 2015 and 2016	438
Table 10-33 Active battery storage projects in the PJM queue system by submitted year: 2012 to 2016	439
Table 10-34 PJM Regulation Market required MW and ratio of eligible supply to requirement for on and off peak hours: 2015 and 2016	440
Table 10-35 Regulation market monthly three pivotal supplier results: 2014 through 2016	441
Table 10-36 RegD self-scheduled regulation by month: October 2012 through December 2016	443
Table 10-37 Regulation sources: spot market, self-scheduled, bilateral purchases: 2015 through 2016	444
Table 10-38 Regulation sources by year: 2012 through 2016	444
Table 10-39 PJM regulation market monthly weighted average market-clearing price, marginal unit opportunity cost and offer price from five minute market solution data (Dollars per MW): 2016	446
Table 10-40 Total regulation charges: 2015 and 2016	446
Table 10-41 Components of regulation cost, 2016	447
Table 10-42 Comparison of average price and cost for PJM regulation: 2009 through 2016	447
Table 10-43 Black start revenue requirement charges: 2010 through 2016	449
Table 10-44 Black start zonal charges for network transmission use: 2015 and 2016	449
Table 10-45 Black start zonal revenue requirement estimate: 2016/2017 through 2018/2019 delivery years	450
Table 10-46 Reactive zonal charges for network transmission use: 2015 and 2016	455

## SECTION 11 CONGESTION AND MARGINAL LOSSES 457

Table 11-1 PJM real-time, load-weighted average LMP components (Dollars per MWh): 2009 through 2016	460
Table 11-2 PJM day-ahead, load-weighted average LMP components (Dollars per MWh): 2009 through 2016	460
Table 11-3 Zonal and PJM real-time, load-weighted average LMP components (Dollars per MWh): 2015 and 2016	461
Table 11-4 Zonal and PJM day-ahead, load-weighted average LMP components (Dollars per MWh): 2015 and 2016	461
Table 11-5 Hub real-time, load-weighted average LMP components (Dollars per MWh): 2015 and 2016	462
Table 11-6 Hub day-ahead, load-weighted average LMP components (Dollars per MWh): 2015 and 2016	462
Table 11-7 Total PJM costs by component (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2016	462
Table 11-8 Total PJM congestion (Dollars (Millions)): 2008 through 2016	464
Table 11-9 Total PJM congestion costs by accounting category by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2008 through 2016	465
Table 11-10 Total PJM congestion costs by transaction type by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2016	465
Table 11-11 Total PJM congestion costs by transaction type by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2015	466
Table 11-12 Change in total PJM congestion costs by transaction type by market: 2015 to 2016 (Dollars (Millions))	466
Table 11-13 Monthly PJM congestion costs by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2015 and 2016	467
Table 11-14 Monthly PJM congestion costs by virtual transaction type and by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2016	468
Table 11-15 Monthly PJM congestion costs by virtual transaction type and by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2015	468
Table 11-16 Congestion summary (By facility type): 2016	469
Table 11-17 Congestion summary (By facility type): 2015	470
Table 11-18 Congestion event hours (day-ahead against real-time): 2015 and 2016	470
Table 11-19 Congestion event hours (real-time against day-ahead): 2015 and 2016	470
Table 11-20 Congestion summary (By facility voltage): 2016	471
Table 11-21 Congestion summary (By facility voltage): 2015	471
Table 11-22 Top 25 constraints with frequent occurrence: 2015 and 2016	472
Table 11-23 Top 25 constraints with largest year-to-year change in occurrence: 2015 and 2016	472
Table 11-24 Top 25 constraints affecting PJM congestion costs (By facility): 2016	473
Table 11-25 Top 25 constraints affecting PJM congestion costs (By facility): 2015	474
Table 11-26 Top 20 congestion cost impacts from MISO flowgates affecting PJM dispatch (By facility): 2016	476
Table 11-27 Top 20 congestion cost impacts from MISO flowgates affecting PJM dispatch (By facility): 2015	476
Table 11-28 Top two congestion cost impacts from NYISO flowgates affecting PJM dispatch (By facility): 2016	477

Table 11-29 Top two congestion cost impacts from NYISO flowgates affecting PJM dispatch (By facility): 2015	477
Table 11-30 Regional constraints summary (By facility): 2016	478
Table 11-31 Regional constraints summary (By facility): 2015	478
Table 11-32 Congestion cost by type of participant: 2016	479
Table 11-33 Congestion cost by type of participant: 2015	479
Table 11-34 Total component costs (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2016	482
Table 11-35 Total PJM marginal loss costs by accounting category (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2016	482
Table 11-36 Total PJM marginal loss costs by accounting category by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2016	483
Table 11-37 Total PJM loss costs by transaction type by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2016	483
Table 11-38 Total PJM loss costs by transaction type by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2015	483
Table 11-39 Monthly marginal loss costs by market (Millions): 2015 and 2016	484
Table 11-40 Monthly PJM loss costs by virtual transaction type and by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2016	485
Table 11-41 Monthly PJM loss costs by virtual transaction type and by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2015	485
Table 11-42 Marginal loss credits (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2016	486
Table 11-43 Total PJM costs by energy component (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2016	486
Table 11-44 Total PJM energy costs by accounting category (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2016	486
Table 11-45 Total PJM energy costs by market category (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2016	487
Table 11-46 Total PJM energy costs by transaction type by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2016	487
Table 11-47 Total PJM energy costs by transaction type by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2015	487
Table 11-48 Monthly energy costs by market type (Dollars (Millions)): 2015 and 2016	488
Table 11-49 Monthly PJM energy costs by virtual transaction type and by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2016	489
Table 11-50 Monthly PJM energy costs by virtual transaction type and by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2015	489
<b>SECTION 12 GENERATION AND TRANSMISSION PLANNING</b>	<b>491</b>
Table 12-1 Queue comparison by expected completion year (MW): December 31, 2015 to December 31, 2016	495
Table 12-2 Change in project status (MW): December 31, 2015 to December 31, 2016	496
Table 12-3 Capacity in PJM queues (MW): At December 31, 2016	496
Table 12-4 Queue capacity by LDA, control zone and fuel (MW): At December 31, 2016	497
Table 12-5 Summary of PJM unit retirements by fuel (MW): 2011 through 2020	498
Table 12-6 Planned retirement of PJM units: as of December 31, 2016	499
Table 12-7 Retirements by fuel type: 2011 through 2020	499
Table 12-8 Retirements (MW) by fuel type and state: 2011 through 2020	500
Table 12-9 Unit deactivations in 2016	500
Table 12-10 Existing PJM capacity: At December 31, 2016 (By zone and unit type (MW))	501

Table 12-11 PJM capacity (MW) by age (years): At December 31, 2016	501
Table 12-12 PJM generation planning process	503
Table 12-13 Last milestone at time of withdrawal: January 1, 1997 through December 31, 2016	503
Table 12-14 Average project queue times (days): At December 31, 2016	503
Table 12-15 PJM generation planning summary: At December 31, 2016	504
Table 12-16 Number of projects entered in the queue as of December 31, 2016	504
Table 12-17 Queue details by fuel group: At December 31, 2016	504
Table 12-18 Status of all generation queue projects: January 1, 1997 through December 31, 2016	505
Table 12-19 Status of all generation queue projects as percent of total projects by classification: January 1, 1997 through December 31, 2016	505
Table 12-20 Status of all generation capacity (MW) in the PJM generation queue: January 1, 1997 through December 31, 2016	506
Table 12-21 Status of all generation queue projects as percent of total MW in project classification: January 1, 1997 through December 31, 2016	507
Table 12-22 Status of all natural gas generation queue projects: January 1, 1997 through December 31, 2016	507
Table 12-23 Status of all natural gas generation capacity (MW) in the PJM generation queue: January 1, 1997 through December 31, 2016	508
Table 12-24 Status of all wind generation queue projects: January 1, 1997 December 31, 2016	508
Table 12-25 Status of all wind generation capacity (MW) in the PJM generation queue: January 1, 1997 through December 31, 2016	509
Table 12-26 Status of all solar generation queue projects: January 1, 1997 through December 31, 2016	510
Table 12-27 Current status of all solar generation capacity (MW) in the PJM generation queue: January 1, 1997 through December 31, 2016	510
Table 12-28 Relationship between project developer and Transmission Owner for all interconnection queue projects MW by fuel type: January 1, 1997 through December 31, 2016	511
Table 12-29 Relationship between project developer and Transmission Owner for all solar project MW in PJM interconnection queue: January 1, 1997 through December 31, 2016	512
Table 12-30 Transmission facility outage request summary by planned duration: 2015 and 2016	513
Table 12-31 PJM transmission facility outage request received status definition	513
Table 12-32 Transmission facility outage request summary by received status: 2015 and 2016	513
Table 12-33 Transmission facility outage request summary by emergency: 2015 and 2016	514
Table 12-34 Transmission facility outage request summary by congestion: 2015 and 2016	514
Table 12-35 Transmission facility outage requests that by received status, congestion and emergency: 2015 and 2016	514
Table 12-36 Transmission facility outage requests that might cause congestion status summary: 2015 and 2016	515
Table 12-37 Rescheduled and cancelled transmission outage request summary: 2015 and 2016	515
Table 12-38 Transmission outage summary: 2015 and 2016	516
Table 12-39 Summary of potentially long duration (> 30 days) outages: 2015 and 2016	516
Table 12-40 Transmission facility outage requests by received status: Planning periods 2015 to 2016 and 2016 to 2017	517

Table 12-41 Transmission facility outage requests by received status and emergency: Planning periods 2015 to 2016 and 2016 to 2017	517
Table 12-42 Transmission facility outage requests by submission status and congestion: Planning periods 2015 to 2016 and 2016 to 2017	517
Table 12-43 Transmission facility outage requests by received status and processed status: Planning periods 2015 to 2016 and 2016 to 2017	518
Table 12-44 Transmission facility outage requests by received status, processed status, emergency and congestion: Planning periods 2015 to 2016 and 2016 to 2017	519
Table 12-45 Transmission facility outage requests by received status and bidding opening date: Planning periods 2015 to 2016 and 2016 to 2017	519
Table 12-46 Late transmission facility outage requests that are submitted after annual bidding opening date: Planning periods 2015 to 2016 and 2016 to 2017	520
<b>SECTION 13 FINANCIAL TRANSMISSION AND AUCTION REVENUE RIGHTS</b>	<b>523</b>
Table 13-1 The FTR Auction Markets results were competitive	524
Table 13-2 Annual FTR product dates	526
Table 13-3 Top 10 principal binding transmission constraints limiting the Annual ARR Allocation: Planning period 2015 to 2016	533
Table 13-4 Historic Stage 1B and Stage 2 ARR Allocations from the 2011 to 2012 through 2016 to 2017 planning periods	535
Table 13-5 Top 10 principal binding transmission constraints limiting the Annual ARR Allocation: Planning period 2016 to 2017	535
Table 13-6 ARRs and ARR revenue automatically reassigned for network load changes by control zone: June 1, 2015, through December 31, 2016	535
Table 13-7 IARR allocation volume: Planning periods 2008 to 2009 through 2016 to 2017	536
Table 13-8 IARRs allocated for the 2015 to 2016 Annual ARR Allocation for RTEP upgrades	536
Table 13-9 Residual ARR allocation volume and target allocation: 2016	536
Table 13-10 Annual ARR Allocation volume: planning periods 2015 to 2016 and 2016 to 2017	537
Table 13-11 Overloaded facility type and reason: 2016/2017 planning period	537
Table 13-12 Projected ARR revenue adequacy (Dollars (Millions)): Planning periods 2015 to 2016 and 2016 to 2017	538
Table 13-13 Excess Auction Revenue: Planning periods 2010 to 2011 through 2016 to 2017	539
Table 13-14 Top 10 principal binding transmission constraints limiting the Long Term FTR Auction: Planning periods 2017 to 2020	542
Table 13-15 Top 10 principal binding transmission constraints limiting the Annual FTR Auction: Planning period 2016 to 2017	543
Table 13-16 Long Term FTR Auction patterns of ownership by FTR direction: Planning periods 2017 to 2020	544
Table 13-17 Annual FTR Auction patterns of ownership by FTR direction: Planning period 2016 to 2017	544
Table 13-18 Monthly Balance of Planning Period FTR Auction patterns of ownership by FTR direction: 2016	544
Table 13-19 Daily FTR net position ownership by FTR direction: 2016	544

Table 13-20 Long Term FTR Auction market volume: Planning period 2017 to 2020	545
Table 13-21 Annual FTR Auction market volume: Planning period 2016 to 2017	546
Table 13-22 Comparison of self-scheduled FTRs: Planning periods 2009 to 2010 through 2016 to 2017	547
Table 13-23 Monthly Balance of Planning Period FTR Auction market volume: 2016	548
Table 13-24 Monthly Balance of Planning Period FTR Auction buy-bid, bid and cleared volume (MW per period): 2016	549
Table 13-25 Secondary bilateral FTR market volume: Planning periods 2015 to 2016 and 2016 to 2017	550
Table 13-26 Long Term FTR Auction weighted-average cleared prices (Dollars per MW): Planning periods 2017 to 2020	551
Table 13-27 Annual FTR Auction weighted-average cleared prices (Dollars per MW): Planning period 2016 to 2017	552
Table 13-28 Monthly Balance of Planning Period FTR Auction cleared, weighted-average, buy-bid price per period (Dollars per MW): January through December, 2016	552
Table 13-29 FTR profits by organization type and FTR direction: 2016	553
Table 13-30 Monthly FTR profits by organization type: 2016	553
Table 13-31 Yearly FTR profits by organization type: 2011 through 2016	553
Table 13-32 Long Term FTR Auction Revenue: Planning periods 2017 to 2020	554
Table 13-33 Annual FTR Auction revenue: Planning period 2015 to 2016	555
Table 13-34 Monthly Balance of Planning Period FTR Auction revenue: 2016	556
Table 13-35 Total annual PJM FTR revenue detail (Dollars (Millions)): Planning periods 2015 to 2016 and 2016 to 2017	559
Table 13-36 Monthly FTR accounting summary (Dollars (Millions)): Planning period 2015 to 2016 and 2016 to 2017	560
Table 13-37 PJM reported FTR payout ratio by planning period	561
Table 13-38 End of planning period FTR uplift charge example	562
Table 13-39 Example of FTR payouts from portfolio netting and without portfolio netting	564
Table 13-40 Monthly positive and negative target allocations and payout ratios with and without hourly netting: Planning period 2015 to 2016 and 2016 to 2017	564
Table 13-41 Change in positive target allocation payout ratio given portfolio construction	565
Table 13-42 Nodal day-ahead CLMPs	566
Table 13-43 Mathematically equivalent FTR payments with and without portfolio netting	566
Table 13-44 Example implementation of counter flow adjustment method	567
Table 13-45 Counter flow FTR payout ratio adjustment impacts: Planning period 2015 to 2016 and 2016 to 2017	568
Table 13-46 ARR and FTR total congestion offset (in millions) for ARR holders: Planning periods 2011 to 2012 through 2016 to 2017	569
Table 13-47 ARR and FTR total congestion offset (in millions) for ARR holders under PJM's proposed FTR funding: Planning periods 2011 to 2012 through 2016 to 2017	571