

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

<b>PREFACE</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>SECTION 1 INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
2015 in Review	1
PJM Market Summary Statistics	4
PJM Market Background	4
Conclusions	5
Role of MMU	9
Reporting	9
Monitoring	9
Market Design	10
New Recommendations	10
New Recommendation from Section 3, Energy Market	11
New Recommendations from Section 4, Energy Uplift	11
New Recommendations from Section 6, Demand Response	11
New Recommendations from Section 9, Interchange Transactions	12
New Recommendations from Section 10, Ancillary Services	12
New Recommendations from Section 12, Planning	12
New Recommendations from Section 13, Financial Transmission Rights	12
Total Price of Wholesale Power	13
Components of Total Price	13
Section Overviews	14
Overview: Section 3, "Energy Market"	14
Overview: Section 4, "Energy Uplift"	20
Overview: Section 5, "Capacity Market"	24
Overview: Section 6, "Demand Response"	29
Overview: Section 7, "Net Revenue"	34
Overview: Section 8, "Environmental and Renewables"	35
Overview: Section 9, "Interchange Transactions"	38
Overview: Section 10, "Ancillary Services"	41
Overview: Section 11, "Congestion and Marginal Losses"	46
Overview: Section 12, "Planning"	48
Overview: Section 13, "FTR and ARRs"	52
<b>SECTION 2 RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>59</b>
New Recommendations for 2015	59
New Recommendation from Section 3, Energy Market	59
New Recommendations from Section 4, Energy Uplift	60
New Recommendations from Section 6, Demand Response	60
New Recommendations from Section 9, Interchange Transactions	61
New Recommendations from Section 10, Ancillary Services	61
New Recommendations from Section 12, Planning	61
New Recommendations from Section 13, Financial Transmission Rights	61
History of MMU Recommendations	62
Complete List of Current MMU Recommendations	63

Section 3, Energy Market	63
Section 4, Energy Uplift	64
Section 5, Capacity	66
Section 6, Demand Response	68
Section 7, Net Revenue	69
Section 8, Environmental	69
Section 9, Interchange Transactions	69
Section 10, Ancillary Services	70
Section 11, Congestion and Marginal Losses	71
Section 12, Planning	71
Section 13, FTRs and ARRs	72
<b>SECTION 3 ENERGY MARKET</b>	<b>75</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>76</b>
Market Structure	76
Market Behavior	77
Market Performance	78
Scarcity	78
Recommendations	78
Conclusion	80
<b>Market Structure</b>	<b>82</b>
Market Concentration	82
Ownership of Marginal Resources	83
Type of Marginal Resources	84
Supply	85
Demand	92
<b>Market Behavior</b>	<b>98</b>
Offer Capping for Local Market Power	98
TPS Test Statistics	101
Parameter Limited Schedules	102
Markup Index	104
Frequently Mitigated Units and Associated Units	106
Virtual Offers and Bids	108
Generator Offers	116
<b>Market Performance</b>	<b>118</b>
Markup	118
Prices	126
<b>Scarcity</b>	<b>140</b>
Emergency procedures	140
Scarcity and Scarcity Pricing	144
PJM Cold Weather Operations 2015	144
<b>SECTION 4 ENERGY UPLIFT (OPERATING RESERVES)</b>	<b>147</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>147</b>
Energy Uplift Results	147
Characteristics of Credits	147
Geography of Charges and Credits	148
Energy Uplift Issues	148

Energy Uplift Recommendations	148
Recommendations	148
Conclusion	150
<b>Energy Uplift</b>	<b>151</b>
Credits and Charges Categories	151
<b>Energy Uplift Results</b>	<b>153</b>
Energy Uplift Charges	153
Operating Reserve Rates	156
Reactive Services Rates	157
Balancing Operating Reserve Determinants	159
Energy Uplift Credits	160
<b>Characteristics of Credits</b>	<b>160</b>
Types of Units	160
Concentration of Energy Uplift Credits	161
Economic and Noneconomic Generation	163
<b>Geography of Charges and Credits</b>	<b>164</b>
<b>Energy Uplift Issues</b>	<b>166</b>
Lost Opportunity Cost Credits	166
Black Start Service Units	169
Closed Loop Interfaces	169
Price Setting Logic	171
Confidentiality of Energy Uplift Information	172
<b>Energy Uplift Recommendations</b>	<b>172</b>
Recommendations for Calculation of Credits	172
Recommendations for Allocation of Charges	177
Quantifiable Recommendations Impact	181
<b>Analysis of Changes in Annual Uplift Charges</b>	<b>182</b>
<b>Five Year Energy Uplift Charges Analysis</b>	<b>183</b>
<b>SECTION 5 CAPACITY MARKET</b>	<b>185</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>185</b>
RPM Capacity Market	185
Generator Performance	189
Recommendations	189
Conclusion	190
<b>Installed Capacity</b>	<b>193</b>
<b>RPM Capacity Market</b>	<b>194</b>
Market Structure	194
Market Conduct	206
Market Performance	213
<b>Generator Performance</b>	<b>219</b>
Capacity Factor	219
Generator Performance Factors	220
Generator Forced Outage Rates	221

<b>SECTION 6 DEMAND RESPONSE</b>	<b>229</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>229</b>
Recommendations	230
Conclusion	231
<b>PJM Demand Response Programs</b>	<b>233</b>
<b>Participation in Demand Response Programs</b>	<b>234</b>
Economic Program	235
Emergency and Pre-Emergency Programs	241
<b>SECTION 7 NET REVENUE</b>	<b>251</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>251</b>
Net Revenue	251
Conclusion	251
<b>Net Revenue</b>	<b>252</b>
Spark Spreads, Dark Spreads, and Quark Spreads	252
Theoretical Energy Market Net Revenue	253
Capacity Market Net Revenue	255
<b>Net Revenue Adequacy</b>	<b>256</b>
Levelized Total Costs	256
New Entrant Combustion Turbine	257
New Entrant Combined Cycle	259
New Entrant Coal Plant	261
New Entrant Diesel	263
New Entrant Nuclear Plant	264
New Entrant Wind Installation	265
New Entrant Solar Installation	266
Factors in Net Revenue Adequacy	266
Actual Net Revenue	268
<b>SECTION 8 ENVIRONMENTAL AND RENEWABLE ENERGY REGULATIONS</b>	<b>275</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>275</b>
Federal Environmental Regulation	275
State Environmental Regulation	276
Emissions Controls in PJM Markets	277
State Renewable Portfolio Standards	277
Conclusion	277
<b>Federal Environmental Regulation</b>	<b>278</b>
Control of Mercury and Other Hazardous Air Pollutants	278
Air Quality Standards: Control of NO <sub>x</sub> , SO <sub>2</sub> and O <sub>3</sub> Emissions Allowances	279
Emission Standards for Reciprocating Internal Combustion Engines	281
Regulation of Greenhouse Gas Emissions	282
Federal Regulation of Environmental Impacts on Water	284
Federal Regulation of Waste Disposal	284
<b>State Environmental Regulation</b>	<b>285</b>
New Jersey High Electric Demand Day (HEDD) Rules	285
Illinois Air Quality Standards (NO <sub>x</sub> , SO <sub>2</sub> and Hg)	286
State Regulation of Greenhouse Gas Emissions	286

Renewable Portfolio Standards	288
<b>Emissions Controlled Capacity and Renewables in PJM Markets</b>	<b>293</b>
Emission Controlled Capacity in the PJM Region	293
Wind Units	295
Solar Units	296
<b>SECTION 9 INTERCHANGE TRANSACTIONS</b>	<b>299</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>299</b>
Interchange Transaction Activity	299
Interactions with Bordering Areas	299
Recommendations	300
Conclusion	301
<b>Interchange Transaction Activity</b>	<b>302</b>
Aggregate Imports and Exports	302
Real-Time Interface Imports and Exports	303
Real-Time Interface Pricing Point Imports and Exports	306
Day-Ahead Interface Imports and Exports	309
Day-Ahead Interface Pricing Point Imports and Exports	311
Loop Flows	317
PJM and MISO Interface Prices	324
PJM and NYISO Interface Prices	326
Summary of Interface Prices between PJM and Organized Markets	328
Neptune Underwater Transmission Line to Long Island, New York	328
Linden Variable Frequency Transformer (VFT) facility	330
Hudson Direct Current (DC) Merchant Transmission Line	331
<b>Operating Agreements with Bordering Areas</b>	<b>332</b>
PJM and MISO Joint Operating Agreement	333
PJM and New York Independent System Operator Joint Operating Agreement (JOA)	334
PJM and TVA Joint Reliability Coordination Agreement (JRCA)	336
PJM and Duke Energy Progress, Inc. Joint Operating Agreement	336
PJM and VACAR South Reliability Coordination Agreement	337
Balancing Authority Operations Coordination Agreement between Wisconsin Electric Power Company (WEC) and PJM Interconnection, LLC	338
Northeastern ISO-Regional Transmission Organization Planning Coordination Protocol	338
Interface Pricing Agreements with Individual Balancing Authorities	338
Other Agreements with Bordering Areas	339
<b>Interchange Transaction Issues</b>	<b>339</b>
PJM Transmission Loading Relief Procedures (TLRs)	339
Up to Congestion	341
Sham Scheduling	345
Elimination of Ontario Interface Pricing Point	345
PJM and NYISO Coordinated Interchange Transactions	347
Reserving Ramp on the PJM/NYISO Interface	351
PJM and MISO Coordinated Interchange Transaction Proposal	351
Willing to Pay Congestion and Not Willing to Pay Congestion	354
Spot Imports	355
Interchange Optimization	356
Interchange Cap During Emergency Conditions	356

45 Minute Schedule Duration Rule	357
Interchange Transaction Credit Screening Process	358
<b>SECTION 10 ANCILLARY SERVICE MARKETS</b>	<b>359</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>360</b>
Primary Reserve	360
Tier 1 Synchronized Reserve	360
Tier 2 Synchronized Reserve Market	361
Non-Synchronized Reserve Market	361
Secondary Reserve (Day-Ahead Scheduling Reserve)	362
Regulation Market	363
Black Start Service	363
Reactive	364
Ancillary Services Costs per MWh of Load: 2004 through 2015	364
Recommendations	364
Conclusion	365
<b>Primary Reserve</b>	<b>366</b>
Market Structure	366
Price and Cost	369
<b>Tier 1 Synchronized Reserve</b>	<b>370</b>
Market Structure	370
Tier 1 Synchronized Reserve Event Response	371
<b>Tier 2 Synchronized Reserve Market</b>	<b>376</b>
Market Structure	376
Market Behavior	379
Market Performance	381
<b>Non-Synchronized Reserve Market</b>	<b>386</b>
Market Structure	387
<b>Secondary Reserve (DASR)</b>	<b>390</b>
Market Structure	390
Market Conduct	391
Market Performance	392
<b>Regulation Market</b>	<b>393</b>
Market Design	393
Market Structure	402
Market Conduct	406
Market Performance	409
<b>Black Start Service</b>	<b>412</b>
<b>Reactive Service</b>	<b>414</b>
<b>SECTION 11 CONGESTION AND MARGINAL LOSSES</b>	<b>415</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>415</b>
Congestion Cost	415
Marginal Loss Cost	416
Energy Cost	417
Conclusion	417
<b>Locational Marginal Price (LMP)</b>	<b>417</b>
Components	417

Hub Components	420
Component Costs	420
<b>Congestion</b>	<b>421</b>
Congestion Accounting	421
Total Congestion	422
<b>Congested Facilities</b>	<b>426</b>
Congestion by Facility Type and Voltage	426
Constraint Duration	429
Constraint Costs	430
Congestion-Event Summary for MISO Flowgates	432
Congestion-Event Summary for NYISO Flowgates	434
Congestion-Event Summary for the 500 kV System	434
Congestion Costs by Physical and Financial Participants	435
Congestion-Event Summary before and after September 8, 2014	436
<b>Marginal Losses</b>	<b>436</b>
Marginal Loss Accounting	436
Marginal Loss Accounting	437
Total Marginal Loss Costs	438
<b>Energy Costs</b>	<b>442</b>
Energy Accounting	442
Total Energy Costs	442
<b>SECTION 12 GENERATION AND TRANSMISSION PLANNING</b>	<b>447</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>447</b>
Planned Generation and Retirements	447
Generation and Transmission Interconnection Planning Process	447
Regional Transmission Expansion Plan (RTEP)	448
Backbone Facilities	448
Transmission Facility Outages	448
Recommendations	448
Conclusion	450
<b>Planned Generation and Retirements</b>	<b>450</b>
Planned Generation Additions	450
Planned Retirements	454
Generation Mix	456
<b>Generation and Transmission Interconnection Planning Process</b>	<b>459</b>
Interconnection Study Phase	459
<b>Regional Transmission Expansion Plan (RTEP)</b>	<b>462</b>
RTEP Cost Allocation	462
<b>TranSource</b>	<b>464</b>
<b>Backbone Facilities</b>	<b>464</b>
<b>Transmission Facility Outages</b>	<b>465</b>
Scheduling Transmission Facility Outage Requests	465
Rescheduling Transmission Facility Outage Requests	468
Long Duration Transmission Facility Outage Requests	469
Transmission Facility Outage Analysis for the FTR Market	469
Transmission Facility Outage Analysis in the Day-Ahead Market	473

<b>SECTION 13 FINANCIAL TRANSMISSION AND AUCTION REVENUE RIGHTS</b>	<b>475</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>476</b>
Auction Revenue Rights	476
Financial Transmission Rights	477
Markets Timeline	478
Recommendations	478
Conclusion	479
<b>Auction Revenue Rights</b>	<b>482</b>
Market Structure	483
Market Performance	487
<b>Financial Transmission Rights</b>	<b>490</b>
Market Performance	495
Revenue Adequacy Issues and Solutions	513
<b>ARRs as a Congestion Offset for Load</b>	<b>520</b>
<b>Credit Issues</b>	<b>521</b>
<b>FTR Forfeitures</b>	<b>521</b>

## FIGURES

<b>SECTION 1 INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
Figure 1-1 PJM's footprint and its 20 control zones	5
Figure 1-2 PJM reported monthly billings (\$ Billion): 2008 through 2015	5
<b>SECTION 2 RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>59</b>
Figure 2-1 History of recommendation creation and closure: 1999 through 2015	62
<b>SECTION 3 ENERGY MARKET</b>	<b>75</b>
Figure 3-1 Fuel source distribution in unit segments: 2015	83
Figure 3-2 PJM hourly energy market HHI: 2015	83
Figure 3-3 Day-ahead marginal up to congestion transaction and generation units: 2014 and 2015	85
Figure 3-4 Average PJM aggregate real-time generation supply curves by offer price: Summer of 2014 and 2015	85
Figure 3-5 Distribution of PJM real-time generation plus imports: 2014 and 2015	87
Figure 3-6 PJM real-time average monthly hourly generation: 2014 through 2015	88
Figure 3-7 Distribution of PJM day-ahead supply plus imports: 2014 and 2015	89
Figure 3-8 PJM day-ahead monthly average hourly supply: 2014 through 2015	90
Figure 3-9 Day-ahead and real-time supply (Average hourly volumes): 2015	91
Figure 3-10 Difference between day-ahead and real-time supply (Average daily volumes): 2014 through 2015	91
Figure 3-11 Map of PJM real-time generation less real-time load by zone: 2015	92
Figure 3-12 PJM footprint calendar year peak loads: 1999 to 2015	93
Figure 3-13 PJM peak-load comparison: Tuesday, July 28, 2015 and Tuesday, June 17, 2014	93
Figure 3-14 Distribution of PJM real-time accounting load plus exports: 2014 and 2015	94
Figure 3-15 PJM real-time monthly average hourly load: 2014 and 2015	94
Figure 3-16 PJM heating and cooling degree days: 2014 and 2015	95
Figure 3-17 Distribution of PJM day-ahead demand plus exports: 2014 and 2015	96
Figure 3-18 PJM day-ahead monthly average hourly demand: 2014 and 2015	97
Figure 3-19 Day-ahead and real-time demand (Average hourly volumes): 2015	98
Figure 3-20 Difference between day-ahead and real-time demand (Average daily volumes): 2014 and 2015	98
Figure 3-21 Offers with varying markups at different MW output levels	99
Figure 3-22 Offers with a positive markup but different economic minimum MW	99
Figure 3-23 Dual fuel unit offers	99
Figure 3-24 Frequently mitigated units and associated units total months eligible: February, 2006 through December, 2015	107

Figure 3-25 Frequently mitigated units and associated units (By month): February, 2006 through December, 2015	108
Figure 3-26 PJM day-ahead aggregate supply curves: 2015 example day	109
Figure 3-27 Monthly bid and cleared INCs, DECs, and UTCs (MW): January 2005 through December 2015	112
Figure 3-28 Daily bid and cleared INCs, DECs, and UTCs (MW): January 2014 through December 2015	112
Figure 3-29 PJM monthly cleared up to congestion transactions by type (MW): January 2005 through December 2015	116
Figure 3-30 PJM daily cleared up to congestion transaction by type (MW): January 2014 through December 2015	116
Figure 3-31 Markup contribution to real-time hourly load-weighted LMP (Unadjusted): 2014 and 2015	121
Figure 3-32 Markup contribution to real-time hourly load-weighted LMP (Adjusted): 2014 and 2015	121
Figure 3-33 Average LMP for the PJM Real-Time Energy Market: 2014 and 2015	127
Figure 3-34 PJM real-time, load-weighted, average LMP: 2015	129
Figure 3-35 PJM real-time, monthly and annual, load-weighted, average LMP: 1999 through 2015	129
Figure 3-36 Spot average fuel price comparison with fuel delivery charges: 2012 through 2015 (\$/MMBtu)	130
Figure 3-37 Average LMP for the PJM Day-Ahead Energy Market: 2014 and 2015	133
Figure 3-38 Day-ahead, monthly and annual, load-weighted, average LMP: June 2000 through December 2015	134
Figure 3-39 Real-time hourly LMP minus day-ahead hourly LMP: 2015	138
Figure 3-40 Monthly average of real-time minus day-ahead LMP: January 2014 through December 2015	138
Figure 3-41 PJM system hourly average LMP: 2015	139
Figure 3-42 Average daily delivered price for natural gas: 2014 and 2015 (\$/MMBtu)	145

## **SECTION 4 ENERGY UPLIFT (OPERATING RESERVES) 147**

Figure 4-1 Daily day-ahead operating reserve rate (\$/MWh): 2014 and 2015	156
Figure 4-2 Daily balancing operating reserve reliability rates (\$/MWh): 2014 and 2015	156
Figure 4-3 Daily balancing operating reserve deviation rates (\$/MWh): 2014 and 2015	157
Figure 4-4 Daily lost opportunity cost and canceled resources rates (\$/MWh): 2014 and 2015	157
Figure 4-5 Daily reactive transfer interface support rates (\$/MWh): 2014 and 2015	158
Figure 4-6 Cumulative share of energy uplift credits in 2014 and 2015 by unit	161
Figure 4-7 PJM Closed loop interfaces map	170
Figure 4-8 Energy uplift charges change from 2014 to 2015 by category	182
Figure 4-9 Energy uplift charges from January 2011 through December 2013 and from February 2014 through December 2015 (\$million per month)	184

<b>SECTION 5 CAPACITY MARKET</b>	<b>185</b>
Figure 5-1 Percentage of PJM installed capacity (By fuel source): June 1, 2007 through June 1, 2018	194
Figure 5-2 Capacity market load obligation served: June 1, 2007 through June 1, 2015	197
Figure 5-3 Map of PJM Locational Deliverability Areas	200
Figure 5-4 Map of PJM RPM EMAAC subzonal LDAs	200
Figure 5-5 Map of PJM RPM ATSI subzonal LDA	200
Figure 5-6 History of PJM capacity prices: 1999/2000 through 2018/2019	217
Figure 5-7 Map of RPM capacity prices: 2015/2016 through 2018/2019	218
Figure 5-8 PJM outages (MW): 2012 through December 2015	220
Figure 5-9 PJM equivalent outage and availability factors: 2007 to 2015	220
Figure 5-10 Trends in the PJM equivalent demand forced outage rate (EFORd): 1999 through 2015	221
Figure 5-11 PJM distribution of EFORd data by unit type: 2015	222
Figure 5-12 PJM EFORd, XEFORd and EFORp: 2015	227
Figure 5-13 PJM monthly generator performance factors: 2015	227
	227
<b>SECTION 6 DEMAND RESPONSE</b>	<b>229</b>
Figure 6-1 Demand response revenue by market: 2008 through 2015	235
Figure 6-2 Economic program credits and MWh by month: January 2010 through December 2015	236
<b>SECTION 7 NET REVENUE</b>	<b>251</b>
Figure 7-1 Energy market net revenue factor trends: 2009 through 2015	252
Figure 7-2 Hourly spark spread for peak hours: 2011 through 2015	253
Figure 7-3 Hourly dark spread for peak hours: 2011 through 2015	253
Figure 7-4 Quark spread for selected zones: 2011 through 2015	253
Figure 7-5 Average short run marginal costs: 2009 through 2015	255
Figure 7-6 New entrant CT net revenue and 20-year levelized total cost by LDA (Dollars per installed MW-year): 2009 through 2015	258
Figure 7-7 New entrant CC net revenue and 20-year levelized total cost by LDA (Dollars per installed MW-year): 2009 through 2015	260
Figure 7-8 New entrant CP net revenue and 20-year levelized total cost by LDA (Dollars per installed MW-year): 2009 through 2015	262
Figure 7-9 New entrant NU net revenue and 20-year levelized total cost by LDA (Dollars per installed MW-year): 2009 through 2015	265
Figure 7-10 PJM distribution of energy and ancillary net revenue by unit type (Dollars per installed MW-year): 2015	270

<b>SECTION 8 ENVIRONMENTAL AND RENEWABLE ENERGY REGULATIONS</b>	<b>275</b>
Figure 8-1 Spot monthly average emission price comparison: 2014 and 2015	287
Figure 8-2 Average solar REC price by jurisdiction: 2009 through 2015	290
Figure 8-3 Average Tier I REC price by jurisdiction: 2009 through 2015	290
Figure 8-4 Average Tier II REC price by jurisdiction: 2009 through 2015	290
Figure 8-5 CO <sub>2</sub> emissions by year (millions of short tons), by PJM units: 1999 through 2015	294
Figure 8-6 SO <sub>2</sub> and NO <sub>x</sub> emissions by year (thousands of short tons), by PJM units: 1999 through 2015	295
Figure 8-7 Average hourly real-time generation of wind units in PJM: 2015	295
Figure 8-8 Average hourly day-ahead generation of wind units in PJM: 2015	296
Figure 8-9 Marginal fuel at time of wind generation in PJM: 2015	296
Figure 8-10 Average hourly real-time generation of solar units in PJM: 2015	296
Figure 8-11 Average hourly day-ahead generation of solar units in PJM: 2015	297
<b>SECTION 9 INTERCHANGE TRANSACTIONS</b>	<b>299</b>
Figure 9-1 PJM real-time and day-ahead scheduled imports and exports: 2015	302
Figure 9-2 PJM real-time and day-ahead scheduled import and export transaction volume history: 1999 through 2015	303
Figure 9-3 PJM's footprint and its external day-ahead and real-time scheduling interfaces	316
Figure 9-4 Real-time and day-ahead daily hourly average price difference (MISO/PJM Interface minus PJM/MISO Interface): 2015	325
Figure 9-5 Real-time and day-ahead daily hourly average price difference (NY/PJM proxy - PJM/NYIS Interface): 2015	327
Figure 9-6 PJM, NYISO and MISO real-time and day-ahead border price averages: 2015	328
Figure 9-7 Neptune hourly average flow: 2015	329
Figure 9-8 Linden hourly average flow: 2015	331
Figure 9-9 Hudson hourly average flow: 2015	332
Figure 9-10 Credits for coordinated congestion management: 2014 and 2015	334
Figure 9-11 Credits for coordinated congestion management (flowgates): 2014 and 2015	335
Figure 9-12 Credits for coordinated congestion management (Ramapo PARs): 2014 and 2015	335
Figure 9-13 Monthly up to congestion cleared bids in MWh: 2005 through 2015	341
Figure 9-14 Monthly cleared PJM/NYIS CTS bid volume: November, 2014 through 2015	351
Figure 9-15 Spot import service use: 2013 through 2015	356
<b>SECTION 10 ANCILLARY SERVICE MARKETS</b>	<b>359</b>
Figure 10-1 PJM RTO Zone and MAD Subzone geography: 2015	367
Figure 10-2 Mid-Atlantic Dominion Subzone primary reserve MW by source (Daily Averages): 2015	368

Figure 10-3 RTO Reserve Zone primary reserve MW by source (Daily Averages): 2015	369
Figure 10-4 Daily weighted average market clearing prices (\$/MW) for synchronized reserve and non-synchronized reserve: 2015	369
Figure 10-5 Daily average tier 1 synchronized reserve supply (MW) in the MAD Subzone: 2015	371
Figure 10-6 Cleared tier 2 synchronized reserve average hourly MW per hour by unit type, RTO Zone: 2015	377
Figure 10-7 Average hourly tier 2 MW by unit type by SRMCP Range: 2015	377
Figure 10-8 Monthly average actual vs default synchronized reserve requirements, RTO Zone and MAD Subzone: January 2014 through December 2015	378
Figure 10-9 Mid-Atlantic Dominion Reserve Subzone monthly average synchronized reserve required vs. tier 2 synchronized reserve scheduled MW: January 2014 through December 2015	378
Figure 10-10 RTO Reserve Zone monthly average synchronized reserve required vs. tier 2 synchronized reserve scheduled MW: January 2014 through December 2015	378
Figure 10-11 Tier 2 synchronized reserve hourly offer and eligible volume (MW), averaged daily: 2015	380
Figure 10-12 Mid-Atlantic Dominion subzone average daily tier 2 synchronized reserve offer by unit type (MW): 2012 through 2015	381
Figure 10-13 RTO Zone average daily tier 2 synchronized reserve offer by unit type (MW): 2012 through 2015	381
Figure 10-14 Synchronized reserve events duration distribution curve: 2011 through 2015	386
Figure 10-15 Daily average MAD subzone non-synchronized reserve market clearing price and MW purchased: 2015	389
Figure 10-16 Daily average RTO Zone non-synchronized reserve market clearing price and MW purchased: 2015	389
Figure 10-17 Daily average components of DASR clearing price (\$/MW), marginal unit offer and LOC: 2015	393
Figure 10-18 Daily average DASR MW by Unit Type sorted from highest to lowest daily requirement: 2015	393
Figure 10-19 Hourly average performance score by unit type: 2015	395
Figure 10-20 Hourly average performance score by regulation signal type: 2015	395
Figure 10-21 Daily average marginal benefit factor and mileage ratio: 2015	396
Figure 10-22 Average cleared RegD MW and average cleared RegD with an effective price of \$0.00 by month: January 2014 through December 2015	397
Figure 10-23 Maximum, minimum, and average PJM calculated marginal benefit factor by month: 2015	397
Figure 10-24 Benefit Factor Curve before and after December 14, 2015 revisions by PJM	398
Figure 10-25 Example marginal benefit line in percent RegD and RegD MW terms	399
Figure 10-26 Illustration of correct method for calculating effective MW	399
Figure 10-27 Example of Pre and Post December 14, 2015, Effective MW Calculations for RegD MW offered at \$0.00 or as Self Supply	400

Figure 10-28 Average monthly peak effective MW: PJM market calculated versus benefit factor based: January 2014 through December 2015	400
Figure 10-29 Cost of excess effective MW cleared by month, peak and off peak: 2014 through 2015	401
Figure 10-30 Daily average percent of RegD effective MW by peak: January through December 2015	402
Figure 10-31 PJM monthly CPS1 and BAAL performance: January 2011 through December 2015	405
Figure 10-32 PJM Regulation Market HHI distribution: 2014 and 2015	406
Figure 10-33 Off peak and on peak regulation levels: 2014 through 2015	407
Figure 10-34 PJM regulation market daily weighted average market-clearing price, marginal unit opportunity cost and offer price (Dollars per MW): 2015	410
<b>SECTION 11 CONGESTION AND MARGINAL LOSSES</b>	<b>415</b>
Figure 11-1 PJM monthly total congestion cost (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2015	425
Figure 11-2 Location of the top 10 constraints by PJM total congestion costs: 2015	431
Figure 11-3 Location of the top 10 constraints by PJM day-ahead congestion costs: 2015	432
Figure 11-4 Location of the top 10 constraints by PJM balancing congestion costs: 2015	432
Figure 11-5 Daily congestion event hours: 2014 through 2015	436
Figure 11-6 PJM monthly marginal loss costs (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2015	440
Figure 11-7 PJM monthly energy costs (Millions): 2009 through 2015	444
<b>SECTION 12 GENERATION AND TRANSMISSION PLANNING</b>	<b>447</b>
Figure 12-1 Map of PJM unit retirements: 2011 through 2020	454
Figure 12-2 PJM capacity (MW) by age (years): At December 31, 2015	457
Figure 12-3 RTEP cost allocation rules	463
Figure 12-4 PJM Backbone Projects	465
<b>SECTION 13 FINANCIAL TRANSMISSION AND AUCTION REVENUE RIGHTS</b>	<b>475</b>
Figure 13-1 Historic Stage 1B and Stage 2 ARR Allocations from the 2011 to 2012 through 2015 to 2016 planning period	485
Figure 13-2 Stage 1A Infeasibility Funding Impact	488
Figure 13-3 Overallocated Stage 1A ARR source points	489
Figure 13-4 Dollars per ARR MW paid to ARR holders: Planning periods 2010 to 2011 through 2015 to 2016	490
Figure 13-5 Monthly excess ARR revenue: Planning periods 2011 to 2012 through 2015 to 2016	490
Figure 13-6 Annual Bid FTR Auction volume: Planning period 2009 to 2010 through 2015 to 2016	497

Figure 13-7 Annual Cleared FTR Auction volume: Planning period 2009 to 2010 through 2015 to 2016	498
Figure 13-8 Cleared auction volume (MW) as a percent of total FTR cleared volume by calendar month: June 2004 through December 2015	500
Figure 13-9 Long Term, Annual and Monthly FTR Auction bid and cleared volume: June 2003 through December 2015	501
Figure 13-10 Annual FTR Auction volume-weighted average buy bid price: Planning period 2009 to 2010 through 2015 to 2016	502
Figure 13-11 Ten largest positive and negative FTR target allocations summed by sink: 2015 to 2016 planning period	507
Figure 13-12 Ten largest positive and negative FTR target allocations summed by source: 2015 to 2016 planning period	507
Figure 13-13 FTR payout ratio by month, excluding and including excess revenue distribution: January 2004 through December 2015	511
Figure 13-14 FTR surplus and the collected Day-Ahead, Balancing and Total congestion: January 2005 through December 2015	519
Figure 13-15 FTR target allocation compared to sources of positive and negative congestion revenue	520
Figure 13-16 Illustration of INC/DEC FTR forfeiture rule	521
Figure 13-17 Monthly FTR forfeitures for physical and financial participants: June 2010 through December 2015	522
Figure 13-18 FTR forfeitures for INCs/DECs and INCs/DECs/UTCs for both the PJM and MMU methods: January 2013 through December 2015	522
Figure 13-19 Illustration of UTC FTR forfeiture rule	523
Figure 13-20 Illustration of UTC FTR Forfeiture rule with one point far from constraint	523



## TABLES

---

<b>SECTION 1 INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
Table 1-1 PJM Market Summary Statistics, 2014 and 2015	4
Table 1-2 The Energy Market results were competitive	6
Table 1-3 The Capacity Market results were competitive	7
Table 1-4 The Regulation Market results were competitive	8
Table 1-5 The Tier 2 Synchronized Reserve Markets results were competitive	8
Table 1-6 The Day-Ahead Scheduling Reserve Market results were competitive	8
Table 1-7 The FTR Auction Markets results were competitive	8
Table 1-8 Total price per MWh by category: 2014 and 2015	14
<b>SECTION 2 RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>59</b>
Table 2-1 Status of MMU reported recommendations: 1999 through 2015	62
<b>SECTION 3 ENERGY MARKET</b>	<b>75</b>
Table 3-1 The energy market results were competitive	75
Table 3-2 PJM hourly energy market HHI: 2014 and 2015	82
Table 3-3 PJM hourly energy market HHI (By supply segment): 2014 and 2015	83
Table 3-4 Marginal unit contribution to PJM real-time, load-weighted LMP (By parent company): 2014 and 2015	83
Table 3-5 Marginal resource contribution to PJM day-ahead, load-weighted LMP (By parent company): 2014 and 2015	84
Table 3-6 Type of fuel used (By real-time marginal units): 2011 through 2015	84
Table 3-7 Day-ahead marginal resources by type/fuel: 2011 through 2015	85
Table 3-8 PJM generation (By fuel source (GWh)): 2014 and 2015	86
Table 3-9 Monthly PJM generation (By fuel source (GWh)): 2015	86
Table 3-10 PJM real-time average hourly generation and real-time average hourly generation plus average hourly imports: 2000 through 2015	88
Table 3-11 PJM day-ahead average hourly supply and day-ahead average hourly supply plus average hourly imports: 2000 through 2015	89
Table 3-12 Day-ahead and real-time supply (MWh): 2014 and 2015	90
Table 3-13 PJM real-time generation less real-time load by zone (GWh): 2014 and 2015	92
Table 3-14 Actual PJM footprint peak loads: 1999 to 2015	93
Table 3-15 PJM real-time average hourly load and real-time average hourly load plus average hourly exports: 1998 through 2015	94
Table 3-16 PJM heating and cooling degree days: 2014 and 2015	95
Table 3-17 PJM day-ahead average demand and day-ahead average hourly demand plus average hourly exports: 2000 through 2015	96
Table 3-18 Cleared day-ahead and real-time demand (MWh): 2014 and 2015	97

Table 3-19 Offer-capping statistics – energy only: 2011 to 2015	100
Table 3-20 Offer-capping statistics for energy and reliability: 2011 through 2015	100
Table 3-21 Offer-capping statistics for reliability: 2011 through 2015	100
Table 3-22 Real-time offer-capped unit statistics: 2014 through 2015	100
Table 3-23 Numbers of hours when control zones experienced congestion resulting from one or more constraints binding for 100 or more hours or from an interface constraint: 2009 through 2015	101
Table 3-24 Three pivotal supplier test details for interface constraints: 2015	101
Table 3-25 Summary of three pivotal supplier tests applied for interface constraints: 2015	102
Table 3-26 Average, real-time marginal unit markup index (By offer price category unadjusted): 2014 and 2015	105
Table 3-27 Average, real-time marginal unit markup index (By offer price category adjusted): 2014 and 2015	105
Table 3-28 Average day-ahead marginal unit markup index (By offer price category, unadjusted): 2014 and 2015	105
Table 3-29 Average day-ahead marginal unit markup index (By offer price category, adjusted): 2014 and 2015	106
Table 3-30 Frequently mitigated units and associated units by total months eligible: 2014 and 2015	107
Table 3-31 Number of frequently mitigated units and associated units (By month): 2014 and 2015	108
Table 3-32 Hourly average number of cleared and submitted INCs, DECs by month: 2014 and 2015	109
Table 3-33 Hourly average of cleared and submitted up to congestion bids by month: 2014 and 2015	110
Table 3-34 Hourly average number of cleared and submitted import and export transactions by month: 2014 and 2015	111
Table 3-35 Type of day-ahead marginal units: 2014 and 2015	111
Table 3-36 PJM INC and DEC bids by type of parent organization (MW): 2014 and 2015	112
Table 3-37 PJM up to congestion transactions by type of parent organization (MW): 2014 and 2015	112
Table 3-38 PJM import and export transactions by type of parent organization (MW): 2014 and 2015	112
Table 3-39 PJM virtual offers and bids by top ten locations (MW): 2014 and 2015	113
Table 3-40 PJM cleared up to congestion import bids by top ten source and sink pairs (MW): 2014 and 2015	113
Table 3-41 PJM cleared up to congestion export bids by top ten source and sink pairs (MW): 2014 and 2015	113
Table 3-42 PJM cleared up to congestion wheel bids by top ten source and sink pairs (MW): 2014 and 2015	114
Table 3-43 PJM cleared up to congestion internal bids by top ten source and sink pairs (MW): 2014 and 2015	114

Table 3-44 Number of PJM offered and cleared source and sink pairs: January 2013 through December 2015	115
Table 3-45 PJM cleared up to congestion transactions by type (MW): 2014 and 2015	116
Table 3-46 Distribution of MW for dispatchable unit offer prices: 2015	117
Table 3-47 Distribution of MW for self scheduled offer prices: 2015	117
Table 3-48 Markup component of the overall PJM real-time, load-weighted, average LMP by primary fuel type and unit type: 2014 and 2015	119
Table 3-49 Monthly markup components of real-time load-weighted LMP (Unadjusted): 2014 and 2015	120
Table 3-50 Monthly markup components of real-time load-weighted LMP (Adjusted): 2014 and 2015	120
Table 3-51 Average real-time zonal markup component (Unadjusted): 2014 and 2015	122
Table 3-52 Average real-time zonal markup component (Adjusted): 2014 and 2015	122
Table 3-53 Average real-time markup component (By price category, unadjusted): 2014 and 2015	123
Table 3-54 Average real-time markup component (By price category, adjusted): 2014 and 2015	123
Table 3-55 Markup component of the annual PJM day-ahead, load-weighted, average LMP by primary fuel type and unit type: 2014 and 2015	123
Table 3-56 Monthly markup components of day-ahead (Unadjusted), load-weighted LMP: 2014 and 2015	124
Table 3-57 Monthly markup components of day-ahead (Adjusted), load-weighted LMP: 2014 and 2015	124
Table 3-58 Day-ahead, average, zonal markup component (Unadjusted): 2014 and 2015	125
Table 3-59 Day-ahead, average, zonal markup component (Adjusted): 2014 and 2015	125
Table 3-60 Average, day-ahead markup (By LMP category, unadjusted): 2014 and 2015	126
Table 3-61 Average, day-ahead markup (By LMP category, adjusted): 2014 and 2015	126
Table 3-62 PJM real-time, average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 1998 through 2015	127
Table 3-63 PJM real-time, load-weighted, average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 1998 through 2015	128
Table 3-64 Zone real-time and real-time, load-weighted, average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 2014 and 2015	128
Table 3-65 PJM real-time annual, fuel-cost adjusted, load-weighted average LMP (Dollars per MWh): year over year	130
Table 3-66 Change in PJM real-time annual, fuel-cost adjusted, load-weighted average LMP (Dollars per MWh) by Fuel-type: year over year	130
Table 3-67 Components of PJM real-time (Unadjusted), load-weighted, average LMP: 2014 and 2015	132
Table 3-68 Components of PJM real-time (Adjusted), load-weighted, average LMP: 2014 and 2015	133
Table 3-69 PJM day-ahead, average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 2001 through 2015	134
Table 3-70 PJM day-ahead, load-weighted, average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 2001 through 2015	134

Table 3-71 Components of PJM day-ahead, (unadjusted), load-weighted, average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 2014 and 2015	135
Table 3-72 Components of PJM day-ahead, (adjusted), load-weighted, average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 2014 and 2015	136
Table 3-73 Cleared UTC profitability by source and sink point: 2014 and 2015	137
Table 3-74 Day-ahead and real-time average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 2014 and 2015	137
Table 3-75 Day-ahead and real-time average LMP (Dollars per MWh): 2001 through 2015	137
Table 3-76 Frequency distribution by hours of PJM real-time LMP minus day-ahead LMP (Dollars per MWh): 2007 through 2015	138
Table 3-77 Summary of emergency events declared: 2014 and 2015	140
Table 3-78 Description of emergency procedures	142
Table 3-79 PJM declared emergency alerts, warnings and actions, 2015	143

## **SECTION 4 ENERGY UPLIFT (OPERATING RESERVES) 147**

---

Table 4-1 Day-ahead and balancing operating reserve credits and charges	152
Table 4-2 Reactive services, synchronous condensing and black start services credits and charges	152
Table 4-3 Total energy uplift charges: 2001 through 2015	153
Table 4-4 Energy uplift charges by category: 2014 and 2015	153
Table 4-5 Monthly energy uplift charges: 2014 and 2015	154
Table 4-6 Day-ahead operating reserve charges: 2014 and 2015	154
Table 4-7 Balancing operating reserve charges: 2014 and 2015	155
Table 4-8 Balancing operating reserve deviation charges: 2014 and 2015	155
Table 4-9 Additional energy uplift charges: 2014 and 2015	155
Table 4-10 Regional balancing charges allocation (Millions): 2014	155
Table 4-11 Regional balancing charges allocation (Millions): 2015	156
Table 4-12 Operating reserve rates (\$/MWh): 2014 and 2015	157
Table 4-13 Operating reserve rates statistics (\$/MWh): 2015	157
Table 4-14 Local voltage support rates: 2014 and 2015	158
Table 4-15 Balancing operating reserve determinants (MWh): 2014 and 2015	159
Table 4-16 Deviations by transaction type: 2015	159
Table 4-17 Energy uplift credits by category: 2014 and 2015	160
Table 4-18 Energy uplift credits by unit type: 2014 and 2015	160
Table 4-19 Energy uplift credits by unit type: 2015	161
Table 4-20 Top 10 units and organizations energy uplift credits: 2015	162
Table 4-21 Identification of balancing operating reserve credits received by the top 10 units by category and region: 2015	162
Table 4-22 Daily energy uplift credits HHI: 2015	162
Table 4-23 Day-ahead and real-time generation (GWh): 2015	163
Table 4-24 Day-ahead and real-time economic and noneconomic generation from units eligible for operating reserve credits (GWh): 2015	163

Table 4-25 Day-ahead and real-time generation receiving operating reserve credits (GWh): 2015	163
Table 4-26 Day-ahead generation scheduled as must run by PJM (GWh): 2014 and 2015	164
Table 4-27 Day-ahead generation scheduled as must run by PJM by category (GWh): 2015	164
Table 4-28 Geography of regional charges and credits: 2015	165
Table 4-29 Geography of reactive services charges: 2015	166
Table 4-30 Monthly lost opportunity cost credits (Millions): 2014 and 2015	167
Table 4-31 Day-ahead generation from combustion turbines and diesels (GWh): 2014 and 2015	167
Table 4-32 Lost opportunity cost credits paid to combustion turbines and diesels by scenario (Millions): 2014 and 2015	168
Table 4-33 Day-ahead generation (GWh) from combustion turbines and diesels receiving lost opportunity cost credits by value: 2014 and 2015	168
Table 4-34 PJM Closed loop interfaces	170
Table 4-35 Impact on energy market lost opportunity cost credits of rule changes (Millions): 2015	176
Table 4-36 Current energy uplift allocation	180
Table 4-37 MMU energy uplift allocation proposal	180
Table 4-38 Current and proposed energy uplift charges by allocation (Millions): 2014 and 2015	181
Table 4-39 Current and proposed average energy uplift rate by transaction: 2014 and 2015	182
Table 4-40 Timeline of main factors that reduced energy uplift from 2011 through 2015	184
<b>SECTION 5 CAPACITY MARKET</b>	<b>185</b>
Table 5-1 The capacity market results were competitive	185
Table 5-2 RPM related MMU reports, 2014 through 2015	191
Table 5-3 PJM installed capacity (By fuel source): January 1, May 31, June 1, and December 31, 2015	194
Table 5-4 Generation capacity changes: 2007/2008 through 2014/2015	196
Table 5-5 Internal capacity: June 1, 2014 to June 1, 2018	196
Table 5-6 Capacity market load obligations served: June 1, 2015	197
Table 5-7 RSI results: 2015/2016 through 2018/2019 RPM Auctions	199
Table 5-8 PJM capacity summary (MW): June 1, 2007 to June 1, 2018	203
Table 5-9 RPM imports: 2007/2008 through 2018/2019 RPM Base Residual Auctions	203
Table 5-10 RPM load management statistics by LDA: June 1, 2014 to June 1, 2018	205
Table 5-11 RPM load management cleared capacity and ILR: 2007/2008 through 2018/2019	205
Table 5-12 RPM load management statistics: June 1, 2007 to June 1, 2018	206
Table 5-13 ACR statistics: 2015/2016 RPM Auctions	210
Table 5-14 ACR statistics: 2016/2017 RPM Auctions	210
Table 5-15 ACR statistics: 2017/2018 RPM Auctions	211

Table 5-16 ACR statistics: 2018/2019 RPM Auctions	211
Table 5-17 APIR statistics: 2015/2016 RPM Base Residual Auction	212
Table 5-18 APIR statistics: 2016/2017 RPM Base Residual Auction	212
Table 5-19 APIR statistics: 2017/2018 RPM Base Residual Auction	212
Table 5-20 APIR statistics: 2018/2019 RPM Base Residual Auction	213
Table 5-21 Capacity prices: 2007/2008 through 2018/2019 RPM Auctions	214
Table 5-22 Weighted average clearing prices by zone: 2015/2016 through 2018/2019	216
Table 5-23 RPM revenue by type: 2007/2008 through 2018/2019	216
Table 5-24 RPM revenue by calendar year: 2007 through 2019	217
Table 5-25 RPM cost to load: 2015/2016 through 2018/2019 RPM Auctions	219
Table 5-26 PJM capacity factor (By unit type (GWh)): 2014 and 2015	220
Table 5-27 EAF by unit type: 2007 through 2015	221
Table 5-28 EMOF by unit type: 2007 through 2015	221
Table 5-29 EPOF by unit type: 2007 through 2015	221
Table 5-30 EFOF by unit type: 2007 through 2015	221
Table 5-31 PJM EFORd data for different unit types: 2007 through 2015	222
Table 5-32 OMC outages: 2015	223
Table 5-33 Contribution to EFOF by unit type by cause: 2015	226
Table 5-34 Contributions to Economic Outages: 2015	226
Table 5-35 PJM EFORd, XEFORd and EFORp data by unit type: 2015	227

## **SECTION 6 DEMAND RESPONSE** **229**

---

Table 6-1 Overview of demand response programs	234
Table 6-2 Economic program registrations on the last day of the month: January 2010 through December 2015	235
Table 6-3 Sum of peak MW reductions for all registrations per month: 2010 through 2015	236
Table 6-4 Credits paid to the PJM economic program participants: 2010 through 2015	236
Table 6-5 PJM economic program participation by zone: 2014 and 2015	237
Table 6-6 Settlements submitted by year in the economic program: 2009 through 2015	237
Table 6-7 Participants and CSPs submitting settlements in the economic program by year: 2009 through 2015	237
Table 6-8 HHI and market concentration in the economic program: 2014 and 2015	237
Table 6-9 Hourly frequency distribution of economic program MWh reductions and credits: 2014 and 2015	238
Table 6-10 Frequency distribution of economic program zonal, load-weighted, average LMP (By hours): 2014 and 2015	238
Table 6-11 Net benefits test threshold prices: April 2012 through December 2015	239
Table 6-12 Hours with price higher than NBT and DR occurrences in those hours: 2014 through 2015	239
Table 6-13 Zonal DR charge: 2015	240
Table 6-14 Zonal DR charge per MWh of load and exports: 2015	240

Table 6-15 Monthly day-ahead and real-time DR charge: 2014 and 2015	241
Table 6-16 HHI value for LDAs by delivery year: 2014/2015 and 2015/2016 Delivery Year	241
Table 6-17 Zonal monthly capacity revenue: January through December 2015	242
Table 6-18 Energy efficiency resources by MW: 2012/2013 through 2015/2016	242
Table 6-19 Lead time by product type: 2014/2015 Delivery Year	243
Table 6-20 Lead time by product type: 2015/2016 Delivery Year	243
Table 6-21 Reduction MW by each demand response method: 2014/2015 Delivery Year	243
Table 6-22 Reduction MW by each demand response method: 2015/2016 Delivery Year	244
Table 6-23 On-site generation fuel type by MW: 2014/2015 and 2015/2016 Delivery Year	244
Table 6-24 Demand response cleared MW UCAP for PJM: 2011/2012 through 2015/2016 Delivery Year	244
Table 6-25 PJM declared load management events: 2015	245
Table 6-26 Demand response event performance: April 21, 2015 and April 22, 2015	247
Table 6-27 Distribution of participant event days and nominated MW across ranges of performance levels across the events: 2015	247
Table 6-28 Distribution of registrations and associated MW in the full option across ranges of minimum dispatch prices: 2014/2015 Delivery Year	248
Table 6-29 Distribution of registrations and associated MW in the emergency full option across ranges of minimum dispatch prices: 2015/2016 Delivery Year	249
<b>SECTION 7 NET REVENUE</b>	<b>251</b>
Table 7-1 New entrant ancillary service revenue (Dollars per MW-year)	254
Table 7-2 Average short run marginal costs: 2015	255
Table 7-3 Capacity revenue by PJM zones (Dollars per MW-year): 2009 through 2015	256
Table 7-4 New entrant 20-year levelized total costs (By plant type (Dollars per installed MW-year))	256
Table 7-5 Energy net revenue for a new entrant gas-fired CT under economic dispatch (Dollars per installed MW-year)	257
Table 7-6 Percent of 20-year levelized total costs recovered by CT energy and capacity net revenue	258
Table 7-7 Energy net revenue for a new entrant CC under economic dispatch (Dollars per installed MW-year)	259
Table 7-8 Percent of 20-year levelized total costs recovered by CC energy and capacity net revenue	260
Table 7-9 Energy net revenue for a new entrant CP (Dollars per installed MW-year)	261
Table 7-10 Percent of 20-year levelized total costs recovered by CP energy and capacity net revenue	262
Table 7-11 Energy market net revenue for a new entrant DS (Dollars per installed MW-year)	263
Table 7-12 Percent of 20-year levelized total costs recovered by DS energy and capacity net revenue	263

Table 7-13 Energy net revenue for a new entrant nuclear plant (Dollars per installed MW-year)	264
Table 7-14 Percent of 20-year levelized total costs recovered by nuclear energy and capacity net revenue: 2009 through 2015	265
Table 7-15 Net revenue for a wind installation (Dollars per installed MW-year)	266
Table 7-16 Percent of 20-year levelized total costs recovered by wind energy and capacity net revenue (Dollars per installed MW-year): 2012 through 2015	266
Table 7-17 PSEG Energy Market net revenue for a solar installation (Dollars per installed MW-year)	266
Table 7-18 Percent of 20-year levelized total costs recovered by solar energy and capacity net revenue (Dollars per installed MW-year)	266
Table 7-19 Internal rate of return sensitivity for CT, CC and CP generators	267
Table 7-20 Debt to equity ratio sensitivity for CT and CC assuming 20 year debt term and 12 percent internal rate of return	267
Table 7-21 Debt term sensitivity for CT and CC assuming 50/50 debt to equity ratio and 12 percent internal rate of return	268
Table 7-22 Interconnection cost sensitivity for 2015 CT and CC	268
Table 7-23 Class average net revenue from energy and ancillary markets and associated recovery of class average avoidable costs and total revenue from all markets and associated recovery of class average avoidable costs: 2015	269
Table 7-24 Energy and ancillary service net revenue by quartile for select technologies: 2015	271
Table 7-25 Capacity revenue by quartile for select technologies: 2015	271
Table 7-26 Combined revenue from all markets by quartile for select technologies: 2015	271
Table 7-27 Avoidable cost recovery by quartile from energy and ancillary net revenue for select technologies: 2015	272
Table 7-28 Avoidable cost recovery by quartile from all PJM Markets for select technologies: 2015	272
Table 7-30 Proportion of units recovering avoidable costs from all markets: 2009 through 2015	273
Table 7-31 Profile of units that did not recover avoidable costs from total market revenues in two of the last three years or did not clear the 16/17 BRA or 17/18 BRA but cleared in previous auctions	273

**SECTION 8 ENVIRONMENTAL AND RENEWABLE ENERGY REGULATIONS 275**

Table 8-1 Current and Proposed CSPAR Ozone Season NO <sub>x</sub> Budgets for Electric Generating Units (before accounting for variability)	280
Table 8-2 Interim and final targets for CO <sub>2</sub> emissions goals for PJM states	283
Table 8-3 Minimum Criteria for Existing CCR Ponds (Surface Impoundments) and Landfills and Date by which Implementation is Expected	285
Table 8-4 HEDD maximum NO <sub>x</sub> emission rates	286

Table 8-5 RGGI CO <sub>2</sub> allowance auction prices and quantities in short tons and metric tonnes: 2009–2011, 2012–2014 and 2015–2017 Compliance Periods	287
Table 8-6 Renewable standards of PJM jurisdictions: 2015 to 2028	288
Table 8-7 REC Tracking Systems in PJM States with Renewable Portfolio Standards	289
Table 8-8 Solar renewable standards by percent of electric load for PJM jurisdictions: 2015 to 2028	289
Table 8-9 Additional renewable standards of PJM jurisdictions: 2015 to 2028	290
Table 8-10 Renewable alternative compliance payments in PJM jurisdictions: As of December 31, 2015	291
Table 8-11 Renewable resource generation by jurisdiction and renewable resource type (GWh): 2015	292
Table 8-12 PJM renewable capacity by jurisdiction (MW): January 4, 2016	292
Table 8-13 Renewable capacity by jurisdiction, non-PJM units registered in GATS (MW), on January 4, 2016	293
Table 8-14 SO <sub>2</sub> emission controls by fuel type (MW), as of December 31, 2015	293
Table 8-15 NO <sub>x</sub> emission controls by fuel type (MW), as of December 31, 2015	294
Table 8-16 Particulate emission controls by fuel type (MW), as of December 31, 2015	294
Table 8-17 Capacity factor of wind units in PJM: 2015	295
Table 8-18 Capacity factor of wind units in PJM by month: 2014 and 2015	295
Table 8-19 Capacity factor of wind units in PJM: 2015	296
Table 8-20 Capacity factor of solar units in PJM by month: 2014 and 2015	297
<b>SECTION 9 INTERCHANGE TRANSACTIONS</b>	<b>299</b>
Table 9-1 Real-time scheduled net interchange volume by interface (GWh): 2015	304
Table 9-2 Real-time scheduled gross import volume by interface (GWh): 2015	305
Table 9-3 Real-time scheduled gross export volume by interface (GWh): 2015	305
Table 9-4 Real-time scheduled net interchange volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2015	307
Table 9-5 Real-time scheduled gross import volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2015	308
Table 9-6 Real-time scheduled gross export volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2015	308
Table 9-7 Day-Ahead scheduled net interchange volume by interface (GWh): 2015	310
Table 9-8 Day-Ahead scheduled gross import volume by interface (GWh): 2015	310
Table 9-9 Day-Ahead scheduled gross export volume by interface (GWh): 2015	311
Table 9-10 Day-ahead scheduled net interchange volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2015	313
Table 9-11 Up to congestion scheduled net interchange volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2015	313
Table 9-12 Day-ahead scheduled gross import volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2015	314
Table 9-13 Up to congestion scheduled gross import volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2015	314

Table 9-14 Day-ahead scheduled gross export volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2015	315
Table 9-15 Up to congestion scheduled gross export volume by interface pricing point (GWh): 2015	315
Table 9-16 Active real-time and day-ahead scheduling interfaces: 2015	316
Table 9-17 Active day-ahead and real-time scheduled interface pricing points: 2015	317
Table 9-18 Net scheduled and actual PJM flows by interface (GWh): 2015	318
Table 9-19 Net scheduled and actual PJM flows by interface pricing point (GWh): 2015	319
Table 9-20 Net scheduled and actual PJM flows by interface pricing point (GWh) (Adjusted for IMO Scheduled Interfaces): 2015	320
Table 9-21 Net scheduled and actual PJM flows by interface and interface pricing point (GWh): 2015	321
Table 9-22 Net scheduled and actual PJM flows by interface pricing point and interface (GWh): 2015	322
Table 9-23 PJM and MISO flow based hours and average hourly price differences: 2015	325
Table 9-24 Distribution of hourly flows that are consistent and inconsistent with price differences between PJM and MISO: 2015	326
Table 9-25 PJM and NYISO flow based hours and average hourly price differences: 2015	327
Table 9-26 Distribution of hourly flows that are consistent and inconsistent with price differences between PJM and NYISO: 2015	327
Table 9-27 PJM and NYISO flow based hours and average hourly price differences (Neptune): 2015	328
Table 9-28 Percent of scheduled interchange across the Neptune line by primary rights holder: July 2007 through 2015	329
Table 9-29 PJM and NYISO flow based hours and average hourly price differences (Linden): 2015	330
Table 9-30 Percentage of scheduled interchange across the Linden VFT Line by primary rights holder: November 2009 through 2015	331
Table 9-31 PJM and NYISO flow based hours and average hourly price differences (Hudson): 2015	331
Table 9-32 Percentage of scheduled interchange across the Hudson Line by primary rights holder: May 2013 through 2015	332
Table 9-33 Summary of elements included in operating agreements with bordering areas	333
Table 9-34 Real-time average hourly LMP comparison for Duke, PEC and NCMPPA: 2015	338
Table 9-35 Day-ahead average hourly LMP comparison for Duke, PEC and NCMPPA: 2015	339
Table 9-36 PJM MISO, and NYISO TLR procedures: 2012 through 2015	340
Table 9-37 Number of TLRs by TLR level by reliability coordinator: 2015	341
Table 9-38 Monthly volume of cleared and submitted up to congestion bids: 2010 through 2015	342
Table 9-39 Credit risk associated with varying levels of potential uplift: September 8, 2014 through December 31, 2015	344
Table 9-40 Differences between forecast and actual PJM/NYIS interface prices: 2015	347
Table 9-41 Differences between forecast and actual PJM/NYIS interface prices: 2015	348

Table 9-42 Monthly Differences between forecast and actual PJM/NYIS interface prices (percent of intervals): 2015	349
Table 9-43 Monthly differences between forecast and actual PJM/NYIS interface prices (average price difference): 2015	350
Table 9-44 Differences between forecast and actual PJM/MISO interface prices: 2015	352
Table 9-45 Differences between forecast and actual PJM/MISO interface prices: 2015	352
Table 9-46 Monthly Differences between forecast and actual PJM/MISO interface prices (percent of intervals): 2015	353
Table 9-47 Monthly differences between forecast and actual PJM/MISO interface prices (average price difference): 2015	354
Table 9-48 Monthly uncollected congestion charges: 2010 through 2015	355
<b>SECTION 10 ANCILLARY SERVICE MARKETS</b>	<b>359</b>
Table 10-1 The Regulation Market results were competitive	359
Table 10-2 The Tier 2 Synchronized Reserve Market results were competitive	359
Table 10-3 The Day-Ahead Scheduling Reserve Market results were competitive	359
Table 10-4 History of ancillary services costs per MWh of Load: 2004 through 2015	364
Table 10-5 Average monthly tier 1 and tier 2 synchronized reserve, plus non-synchronized reserve used to satisfy the primary reserve requirement, MAD Subzone: 2015	367
Table 10-6 Average monthly tier 1 and tier 2 synchronized reserve, and non-synchronized reserve used to satisfy the primary reserve requirement, RTO Zone: 2015	368
Table 10-7 MW credited, price, cost, and all-in price for primary reserve and its component products, RTO Reserve Zone: 2015	370
Table 10-8 Monthly average market solution Tier 1 Synchronized Reserve (MW) identified hourly, 2015	370
Table 10-9 Tier 1 synchronized reserve event response costs: January 2014 through December 2015	372
Table 10-10 Weighted price of tier 1 synchronized reserve attributable to a non-synchronized reserve price above zero: January 2014 to December 2015	373
Table 10-11 Dollar impact of paying tier 1 synchronized reserve the SRMCP when the NSRMCP goes above \$0: January 2014 through December 2015	374
Table 10-12 Tier 1 compensation as currently implemented by PJM	374
Table 10-13 Tier 1 compensation as recommended by MMU	375
Table 10-14 ASO tier 1 estimate biasing, January 2014 through December, 2015	375
Table 10-15 Default Tier 2 Synchronized Reserve Markets required MW, RTO Zone and Mid-Atlantic Dominion Subzone	377
Table 10-16 Three pivotal supplier test results for the RTO Zone and MAD Subzone: January 2014 through December 2015	379
Table 10-17 Mid-Atlantic Dominion Subzone, weighted SRMCP and cleared MW (excludes self-scheduled): 2015	382
Table 10-18 RTO Zone only weighted SRMCP and cleared MW (excludes self-scheduled): 2015	382

Table 10-19 RTO Zone, Mid-Atlantic Subzone tier 2 synchronized reserve MW, credits, price, and cost: 2015	383
Table 10-20 Synchronized reserve events greater than 10 minutes, Tier 2 response compliance, RTO Reserve Zone: 2015	384
Table 10-21 Synchronized reserve events, January 2010 through December 2015	386
Table 10-22 Non-synchronized reserve market HHIs: 2015	388
Table 10-23 Non-synchronized reserve market pivotal supply test: 2015	388
Table 10-24 RTO Zone, MAD Subzone non-synchronized reserve MW, credits, price, and cost: 2015	390
Table 10-25 Adjusted Fixed Demand Days: 2015	391
Table 10-26 DASR market three pivotal supplier test results and number of hours with DASRMCP above \$0: 2015	391
Table 10-27 DASR Market, regular hours vs. adjusted fixed demand hours: 2015	392
Table 10-28 DASR Market all hours of DASR market clearing price greater than \$0	393
Table 10-29 Active battery storage projects in the PJM queue system by submitted year from 2012 to 2015	394
Table 10-30 MBF assumed RegD proportions versus market solution realized RegD proportions	402
Table 10-31 PJM regulation capability, daily offer and hourly eligible: January through December 2015	403
Table 10-32 PJM regulation by source in 2014 and 2015	403
Table 10-33 Impact on the PJM Regulation Market of currently regulating units retired in 2015	403
Table 10-34 PJM Regulation Market required MW and ratio of eligible supply to requirement: January through March 2014 and 2015	405
Table 10-35 PJM cleared regulation HHI: 2014 and 2015	406
Table 10-36 Regulation market monthly three pivotal supplier results: 2013 through 2015	406
Table 10-37 RegD self-scheduled regulation by month, October 2012 through December 2015	408
Table 10-38 Regulation sources: spot market, self-scheduled, bilateral purchases: 2014 and 2015	409
Table 10-39 Regulation sources by year: 2011 through 2015	409
Table 10-40 PJM regulation market monthly weighted average market-clearing price, marginal unit opportunity cost and offer price from five minute market solution data (Dollars per MW): 2015	410
Table 10-41 Total regulation charges: January 2014 through December 2015	411
Table 10-42 Components of regulation cost: 2015	411
Table 10-43 Comparison of average price and cost for PJM Regulation, 2011 through 2015	412
Table 10-44 Black start revenue requirement charges: 2010 through 2015	412
Table 10-45 Black start zonal charges for network transmission use: 2014 and 2015	413
Table 10-46 Black start zonal revenue requirement estimate: 2015/2016 through 2018/2019 delivery years	413
Table 10-47 Reactive zonal charges for network transmission use: 2014 and 2015	414

<b>SECTION 11 CONGESTION AND MARGINAL LOSSES</b>	<b>415</b>
Table 11-1 PJM real-time, load-weighted average LMP components (Dollars per MWh): 2009 through 2015	418
Table 11-2 PJM day-ahead, load-weighted average LMP components (Dollars per MWh): 2009 through 2015	418
Table 11-3 Zonal and PJM real-time, load-weighted average LMP components (Dollars per MWh): 2014 and 2015	419
Table 11-4 Zonal and PJM day-ahead, load-weighted average LMP components (Dollars per MWh): 2014 and 2015	419
Table 11-5 Hub real-time, load-weighted average LMP components (Dollars per MWh): 2014 and 2015	420
Table 11-6 Hub day-ahead, load-weighted average LMP components (Dollars per MWh): 2014 and 2015	420
Table 11-7 Total PJM costs by component (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2015	420
Table 11-8 Total PJM congestion (Dollars (Millions)): 2008 through 2015	422
Table 11-9 Total PJM congestion costs by accounting category by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2008 through 2015	422
Table 11-10 Total PJM congestion costs by transaction type by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2015	423
Table 11-11 Total PJM congestion costs by transaction type by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2014	423
Table 11-12 Total PJM congestion costs by transaction type by market: 2014 to 2015 change (Dollars (Millions))	424
Table 11-13 Monthly PJM congestion costs by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2014 and 2015	424
Table 11-14 Monthly PJM congestion costs by virtual transaction type and by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2015	425
Table 11-15 Monthly PJM congestion costs by virtual transaction type and by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2014	426
Table 11-16 Congestion summary (By facility type): 2015	427
Table 11-17 Congestion summary (By facility type): 2014	427
Table 11-18 Congestion event hours (Day-Ahead against Real-Time): 2014 and 2015	427
Table 11-19 Congestion event hours (Real-Time against Day-Ahead): 2014 and 2015	428
Table 11-20 Congestion summary (By facility voltage): 2015	428
Table 11-21 Congestion summary (By facility voltage): 2014	428
Table 11-22 Top 25 constraints with frequent occurrence: 2014 and 2015	429
Table 11-23 Top 25 constraints with largest year-to-year change in occurrence: 2014 and 2015	429
Table 11-24 Top 25 constraints affecting PJM congestion costs (By facility): 2015	430
Table 11-25 Top 25 constraints affecting PJM congestion costs (By facility): 2014	431
Table 11-26 Top 20 congestion cost impacts from MISO flowgates affecting PJM dispatch (By facility): 2015	433

Table 11-27 Top 20 congestion cost impacts from MISO flowgates affecting PJM dispatch (By facility): 2014	433
Table 11-28 Top two congestion cost impacts from NYISO flowgates affecting PJM dispatch (By facility): 2015	434
Table 11-29 Top two congestion cost impacts from NYISO flowgates affecting PJM dispatch (By facility): 2014	434
Table 11-30 Regional constraints summary (By facility): 2015	434
Table 11-31 Regional constraints summary (By facility): 2014	435
Table 11-32 Congestion cost by type of participant: 2015	435
Table 11-33 Congestion cost by type of participant: 2014	435
Table 11-34 Total component costs (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2015	438
Table 11-35 Total PJM marginal loss costs by accounting category (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2015	438
Table 11-36 Total PJM marginal loss costs by accounting category by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2015	438
Table 11-37 Total PJM loss costs by transaction type by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2015	439
Table 11-38 Total PJM loss costs by transaction type by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2014	439
Table 11-39 Monthly marginal loss costs by market (Millions): 2014 and 2015	439
Table 11-40 Monthly PJM loss costs by virtual transaction type and by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2015	440
Table 11-41 Monthly PJM loss costs by virtual transaction type and by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2014	441
Table 11-42 Marginal loss credits (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2015	441
Table 11-43 Total PJM costs by energy component (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2015	442
Table 11-44 Total PJM energy costs by accounting category (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2015	442
Table 11-45 Total PJM energy costs by market category (Dollars (Millions)): 2009 through 2015	443
Table 11-46 Total PJM energy costs by transaction type by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2015	443
Table 11-47 Total PJM energy costs by transaction type by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2014	443
Table 11-48 Monthly energy costs by market type (Dollars (Millions)): 2014 and 2015	444
Table 11-49 Monthly PJM energy costs by virtual transaction type and by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2015	445
Table 11-50 Monthly PJM energy costs by virtual transaction type and by market (Dollars (Millions)): 2014	445

## **SECTION 12 GENERATION AND TRANSMISSION PLANNING** **447**

---

Table 12-1 Year-to-year capacity additions from PJM generation queue: Calendar years 2000 through 2015	451
Table 12-2 Queue comparison by expected completion year (MW): December 31, 2014 vs. December 31, 2015	451
Table 12-3 Change in project status (MW): December 31, 2014 vs. December 31, 2015	452

Table 12-4 Capacity in PJM queues (MW): At December 31, 2015	452
Table 12-5 Queue capacity by LDA, control zone and fuel (MW): At December 31, 2015	453
Table 12-6 Summary of PJM unit retirements by fuel (MW): 2011 through 2020	454
Table 12-7 Planned retirement of PJM units: as of December 31, 2015	455
Table 12-8 Retirements by fuel type: 2011 through 2020	455
Table 12-9 Retirements (MW) by fuel type and state: 2011 through 2020	455
Table 12-10 Unit deactivations in 2015	456
Table 12-11 Existing PJM capacity: At December 31, 2015 (By zone and unit type (MW))	457
Table 12-12 PJM capacity (MW) by age (years): At December 31, 2015	457
Table 12-13 Expected capacity (MW) in five years: as of December 31, 2015	458
Table 12-14 PJM generation planning process	459
Table 12-15 Last milestone completed at time of withdrawal: January 1, 1997 through December 31, 2015	459
Table 12-16 Completed (withdrawn or in service) queue MW: January 1, 1997 through December 31, 2015	460
Table 12-17 Average project queue times (days): At December 31, 2015	460
Table 12-18 PJM generation planning summary: At December 31, 2015	460
Table 12-19 Number of projects entered in the queue as of December 31, 2015	460
Table 12-20 Queue details by fuel group: At December 31, 2015	461
Table 12-21 Summary of project developer relationship to TO parent company	461
Table 12-22 Developer-transmission owner relationship by fuel type	462
Table 12-23 2015 Board approved new baseline upgrades by transmission owner and allocations	463
Table 12-24 Transmission facility outage request summary by planned duration: 2014 and 2015	466
Table 12-25 PJM transmission facility outage request received status definition	466
Table 12-26 Transmission facility outage request summary by received status: 2014 and 2015	466
Table 12-27 Transmission facility outage request summary by emergency: 2014 and 2015	467
Table 12-28 Transmission facility outage request summary by congestion: 2014 and 2015	467
Table 12-29 Transmission facility outage requests that by received status, congestion and emergency: 2014 and 2015	467
Table 12-30 Transmission facility outage requests that might cause congestion status summary: 2014 and 2015	468
Table 12-31 Rescheduled and cancelled transmission outage request summary: 2014 and 2015	468
Table 12-32 Transmission outage summary: 2014 and 2015	469
Table 12-33 Summary of potentially long duration (> 30 days) outages: 2014 and 2015	469
Table 12-34 Transmission facility outage requests by received status: Planning periods 2014 to 2015 and 2015 to 2016	470
Table 12-35 Transmission facility outage requests by received status and emergency: Planning periods 2014 to 2015 and 2015 to 2016	470

Table 12-36 Transmission facility outage requests by submission status and congestion: Planning periods 2014 to 2015 and 2015 to 2016	471
Table 12-37 Transmission facility outage requests by received status and processed status: Planning periods 2014 to 2015 and 2015 to 2016	471
Table 12-38 Transmission facility outage requests by received status, processed status, emergency and congestion: Planning periods 2014 to 2015 and 2015 to 2016	472
Table 12-39 Transmission facility outage requests by received status and bidding opening date: Planning periods 2014 to 2015 and 2015 to 2016	472
Table 12-40 Late transmission facility outage requests that are submitted after annual bidding opening date: Planning periods 2014 to 2015 and 2015 to 2016	473
Table 12-41 Transmission facility outage request instance summary by congestion and emergency: 2014 and 2015	473
Table 12-42 Late transmission facility outage request instance status summary by congestion and emergency: 2014 and 2015	474

## **SECTION 13 FINANCIAL TRANSMISSION AND AUCTION REVENUE RIGHTS 475**

Table 13-1 The FTR Auction Markets results were competitive	476
Table 13-2 Annual FTR product dates	478
Table 13-3 Top 10 principal binding transmission constraints limiting the Annual ARR Allocation: Planning period 2015 to 2016	485
Table 13-4 Historic Stage 1B and Stage 2 ARR Allocations from the 2011 to 2012 through 2015 to 2016 planning periods	486
Table 13-5 ARRs and ARR revenue automatically reassigned for network load changes by control zone: June 1, 2014, through December 31, 2015	486
Table 13-6 Incremental ARR allocation volume: Planning periods 2008 to 2009 through 2015 to 2016	486
Table 13-7 IARRs allocated for the 2015 to 2016 Annual ARR Allocation for RTEP upgrades	487
Table 13-8 Residual ARR allocation volume and target allocation: 2015	487
Table 13-9 Annual ARR Allocation volume: planning periods 2014 to 2015 and 2015 to 2016	488
Table 13-10 Projected ARR revenue adequacy (Dollars (Millions)): Planning periods 2014 to 2015 and 2015 to 2016	489
Table 13-11 Top 10 principal binding transmission constraints limiting the Long Term FTR Auction: Planning periods 2016 to 2019	493
Table 13-12 Top 10 principal binding transmission constraints limiting the Annual FTR Auction: Planning period 2015 to 2016	493
Table 13-13 Long Term FTR Auction patterns of ownership by FTR direction: Planning periods 2016 to 2019	494
Table 13-14 Annual FTR Auction patterns of ownership by FTR direction: Planning period 2015 to 2016	494
Table 13-15 Monthly Balance of Planning Period FTR Auction patterns of ownership by FTR direction: 2015	495

Table 13-16 Daily FTR net position ownership by FTR direction: 2015	495
Table 13-17 Long Term FTR Auction market volume: Planning period 2016 to 2019	496
Table 13-18 Annual FTR Auction market volume: Planning period 2015 to 2016	497
Table 13-19 Comparison of self-scheduled FTRs: Planning periods 2009 to 2010 through 2015 to 2016	498
Table 13-20 Monthly Balance of Planning Period FTR Auction market volume: 2015	499
Table 13-21 Monthly Balance of Planning Period FTR Auction buy-bid, bid and cleared volume (MW per period): 2015	500
Table 13-22 Secondary bilateral FTR market volume: Planning periods 2014 to 2015 and 2015 to 2016	500
Table 13-23 Long Term FTR Auction weighted-average cleared prices (Dollars per MW): Planning periods 2016 to 2019	501
Table 13-24 Annual FTR Auction weighted-average cleared prices (Dollars per MW): Planning period 2015 to 2016	502
Table 13-25 Monthly Balance of Planning Period FTR Auction cleared, weighted-average, buy-bid price per period (Dollars per MW): January through December 2015	503
Table 13-26 FTR profits by organization type and FTR direction: 2015	503
Table 13-27 Monthly FTR profits by organization type: 2015	503
Table 13-28 Long Term FTR Auction Revenue: Planning periods 2016 to 2019	504
Table 13-29 Annual FTR Auction revenue: Planning period 2015 to 2016	505
Table 13-30 Monthly Balance of Planning Period FTR Auction revenue: 2015	506
Table 13-31 Total annual PJM FTR revenue detail (Dollars (Millions)): Planning periods 2014 to 2015 and 2015 to 2016	509
Table 13-32 Unallocated congestion charges: Planning period 2012 to 2013 through 2014 to 2015	510
Table 13-33 Monthly FTR accounting summary (Dollars (Millions)): Planning period 2014 to 2015 and 2015 to 2016	511
Table 13-34 PJM reported FTR payout ratio by planning period	512
Table 13-35 End of planning period FTR uplift charge example	513
Table 13-36 PJM Reported and Actual Monthly Payout Ratios: Planning period 2015 to 2016	513
Table 13-37 Example of FTR payouts from portfolio netting and without portfolio netting	515
Table 13-38 Monthly positive and negative target allocations and payout ratios with and without hourly netting: Planning period 2014 to 2015 and 2015 to 2016	515
Table 13-39 Change in positive target allocation payout ratio given portfolio construction	517
Table 13-40 Nodal day-ahead CLMPs	517
Table 13-41 Mathematically equivalent FTR payments with and without portfolio netting	518
Table 13-42 Example implementation of counter flow adjustment method	518
Table 13-43 Counter flow FTR payout ratio adjustment impacts: Planning period 2014 to 2015 and 2015 to 2016	519
Table 13-44 ARR and FTR total congestion offset (in millions) for ARR holders: Planning periods 2014 to 2015 and 2015 to 2016	520