

MINUTES

MARKET MONITORING UNIT ADVISORY COMMITTEE LOCATION: CONFERENCE AND TRAINING CENTER, PJM INTERCONNECTION DATE: FRIDAY, DECEMBER 1, 2017, 10:00 AM

These notes are from the ninth meeting of the Market Monitoring Unit Advisory Committee (MMUAC), established pursuant to Section III.H of Attachment M of the PJM Open Access Transmission Tariff, effective August 1, 2008. Section III.H provides that the MMUAC "act as a liaison between stakeholders and the MMU" and that it "provide advice from time to time on matters relevant to the MMU's responsibilities under this [PJM Market Monitoring] Plan."

I. OVERVIEW

Joe Bowring provided an overview of the IMM's activities in 2017.

II. SUBSIDIES

Joe Bowring explained the IMM's position opposing various proposals for subsidies for units by fuel type.

III. AGGREGATE MARKET POWER

Catherine Tyler explained the IMM's concerns about aggregate market power and the lack of adequate tariff provisions to mitigate it. She explained the purpose of market power mitigation and described current metrics for measuring structural market power, such as the HHI. She reviewed statistics from the State of the Market report describing market power including a new aggregate pivotal supplier metric. She explained future plans for expanding the analysis of aggregate market power and proposing a method for the mitigation of it.

IV. DAY-AHEAD AND REAL-TIME MARKETS MODELING DIFFERENCES

Howard Haas discussed the differences in day-ahead and real-time models and the implications for virtuals. Mr. Haas explained why the IMM supports PJM's positions on uplift payments by UTCs and bid/offer locations for virtuals.

V. MOPR

Jeffrey Mayes explained the IMM's position on the need for reform of the Minimum Offer Price Rule (MOPR), which protects against noncompetitive low offers in RPM auctions. Mr. Mayes explained the purpose of the MOPR (to prevent noncompetitive offers, including but not limited to monopsony) and discussed the elements of the MOPR reform proposal.

VI. REQUEST FOR STAKEHOLDER FEEDBACK

Joe Bowring solicited and responded to questions and comments from stakeholders concerning the IMM's implementation of the PJM Market Monitoring Plan.

VII. ATTENDANCE – IN PERSON

| Last Name | First Name | Company | Email Address |
|-------------|------------|--------------------------------------|---|
| Borgatti | Michael | Gabel and Associates | michael.borgatti@gabelassociates.com |
| Bowring | Joe | Monitoring Analytics, LLC | joseph.bowring@monitoringanalytics.com |
| Bruce | Susan | McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC | sbruce@mcneeslaw.com |
| Ford | Adrien | Old Dominion Electric Cooperative | aford@odec.com |
| Kogut | George | New York Power Authority | george.kogut@nypa.gov |
| Lieberman | Steven | American Municipal Power, Inc. | slieberman@amppartners.org |
| Mayes | Jeffrey | PJM Interconnection, LLC | jeffrey.mayes@monitoringanalytics.com |
| Pratzon | David | GT Power Group | dpratzon@gtpowergroup.com |
| Scarpignato | David | Calpine Energy Services, L.P. | Scarp@calpine.com |
| Tyler | Catherine | Monitoring Analytics | catherine.tyler@monitoringanalytics.com |
| Walter | Laura | PJM Interconnection, LLC | Laura.Walter@pjm.com |
| Whitehead | Jeffrey | GT Power Group | jeff@jwenergysolutions.com |

VIII. ATTENDANCE – IN PERSON

| Last Name | First Name | Company | Email Address |
|-----------|------------|--|---|
| Campbell | Bruce | EnergyConnect, Inc. | bruce.campbell@cpowerenergymanagement.com |
| Daugherty | Suzanne | PJM Interconnection, LLC | Suzanne.Daugherty@pjm.com |
| Filomena | Guy | Customized Energy Solutions, Ltd. | gfilomena@ces-ltd.com |
| Gahimer | Mike | IN Office of Utility Consumer Counselor | mgahimer@oucc.in.gov |
| Gilani | Rehan | ConEdison Energy, Inc. | gilanir@coneddev.com |
| Hoatson | Tom | Riverside Generating, LLC | thoatson@lspower.com |
| Horstmann | John | Dayton Power & Light Company (The) | john.horstmann@aes.com |
| Horton | Dana | Appalachian Power Company | dehorton@aep.com |
| Midgley | Sharon | Exelon Business Services Company, LLC | sharon.midgley@exeloncorp.com |
| Philips | Marjorie | Direct Energy Business, LLC | marjorie.philips@directenergy.com |
| Rohrbach | John | Southern Maryland Electric Cooperative | jrohrbach@acespower.com |
| Sasser | Jonathan | Customized Energy Solutions, Ltd.* | jsasser@ces-ltd.com |
| Sillin | John | The Federal Energy Regulatory Commission | john.sillin@ferc.gov |
| Smith | Joseph | Public Service Electric & Gas Company | joseph.smith2@pseg.com |
| Thompson | Matt | XO Energy MA, LP | mthompson@xo-energy.com |
| Tsao | Stephanie | SPGlobal | stephanie.tsao@spglobal.com |
| Webster | John | Icetec.com, Inc. | jwebster@icetec.com |