

# Table of Contents

Preface	i
<b>SECTION 1 Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
2023 in Review	1
PJM Market Summary Statistics	5
PJM Market Background	6
Conclusions	7
Energy Market Conclusion	8
Capacity Market Conclusion	9
Synchronized Reserve Market Conclusion	10
Nonsynchronized Reserve Market Conclusion	11
Secondary Reserve Market Conclusion	11
Regulation Market Conclusion	11
FTR Auction Market Conclusion	12
Role of MMU	13
Reporting	13
Monitoring	13
Market Design	14
New Recommendations	14
New Recommendation from Section 5, Capacity Market	14
New Recommendation from Section 6, Demand Response	15
New Recommendations from Section 10, Ancillary Services	15
New Recommendation from Section 12, Generation and Transmission Planning	16
Total Price of Wholesale Power	16
Components of Total Price	16
Section Overviews	20
Overview: Section 3, Energy Market	20
Overview: Section 4, Energy Uplift	31
Overview: Section 5, Capacity Market	36
Overview: Section 6, Demand Response	47
Overview: Section 7, Net Revenue	54
Overview: Section 8, Environmental and Renewables	56
Overview: Section 9, Interchange Transactions	61
Overview: Section 10, Ancillary Services	64
Overview: Section 11, Congestion and Marginal Losses	72
Overview: Section 12, Planning	74
Overview: Section 13, FTRs and ARRs	83
<b>SECTION 2 Recommendations</b>	<b>91</b>
Recommendation Priority	91
Recommendation Status	91
New Recommendations	91
New Recommendation from Section 5, Capacity Market	92
New Recommendation from Section 6, Demand Response	92
New Recommendations from Section 10, Ancillary Services	93

New Recommendation from Section 12, Generation and Transmission Planning	93
<b>History of MMU Recommendations</b>	<b>93</b>
<b>Complete List of Current MMU Recommendations</b>	<b>94</b>
Section 3, Energy Market	94
Section 4, Energy Uplift	99
Section 5, Capacity Market	100
Section 6, Demand Response	104
Section 7, Net Revenue	107
Section 8, Environmental and Renewables	107
Section 9, Interchange Transactions	107
Section 10, Ancillary Services	108
Section 11, Congestion and Marginal Losses	110
Section 12, Planning	110
Section 13, FTRs and ARRs	113
<b>Adopted Recommendations</b>	<b>114</b>
Adopted 2023	114
Adopted 2022	114
Adopted 2021	115
Adopted 2020	116
Adopted 2019	117
Adopted 2018	117
Adopted 2017	117
Adopted 2016	118
Adopted 2015	118
Adopted 2014	119
Adopted 2013	119
Adopted 2012	120
Adopted 2011	120
Adopted 2010	121
Adopted 2009	121
Adopted 2008	122
Adopted 2006	122
<b>SECTION 3 Energy Market</b>	<b>123</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>125</b>
Supply and Demand	125
Competitive Assessment	126
Recommendations	128
Conclusion	133
<b>Supply and Demand</b>	<b>136</b>
Market Structure	136
<b>Market Behavior</b>	<b>148</b>
Generator Offers	148
ICAP Must Offer Requirement	149
Emergency Maximum MW	150
Parameter Limited Schedules	151
Virtual Offers and Bids	157
<b>Market Performance</b>	<b>166</b>

LMP	166
Zonal LMP and Dispatch	190
Fuel Prices, LMP, and Dispatch	196
Components of LMP	203
<b>Shortage</b>	<b>209</b>
Emergency Procedures	210
Power Balance Constraint Violation	211
Shortage and Shortage Pricing	212
<b>Competitive Assessment</b>	<b>223</b>
Market Structure	223
Market Behavior	229
Market Performance	255
Market Structure, Participant Behavior, and Market Performance	265
<b>SECTION 4 Energy Uplift (Operating Reserves)</b>	<b>267</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>268</b>
Energy Uplift Credits	268
Energy Uplift Charges	268
Geography of Charges and Credits	269
Recommendations	269
Conclusion	270
<b>Energy Uplift Credits</b>	<b>273</b>
<b>Categories of Credits and Charges</b>	<b>274</b>
Types of Units	275
Day-Ahead Unit Commitment for Reliability	277
Balancing Operating Reserve Credits/Balancing Generator Credits	278
Lost Opportunity Cost Credits	280
<b>Energy Uplift Charges</b>	<b>282</b>
Energy Uplift Charges	282
Operating Reserve Rates	284
Reactive Services Rates	285
<b>Uplift Eligibility</b>	<b>286</b>
<b>Energy Uplift Issues</b>	<b>287</b>
Uplift Resettlement	287
Uplift Forfeiture Rule	287
Intraday Segments Uplift Settlement	287
Concentration of Energy Uplift Credits	289
Uplift Credits and Market Power Mitigation	291
Fast Start Pricing	292
<b>SECTION 5 Capacity Market</b>	<b>295</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>296</b>
RPM Capacity Market	296
Part V Reliability Service (RMR)	298
Generator Performance	298
Recommendations	298
Conclusion	302
<b>Installed Capacity</b>	<b>310</b>

Fuel Diversity	311
<b>RPM Capacity Market</b>	<b>312</b>
Market Structure	312
Market Conduct	326
Market Performance	332
<b>FRR</b>	<b>336</b>
<b>CRF Issue</b>	<b>337</b>
<b>Timing of Unit Retirements</b>	<b>339</b>
<b>Part V Reliability Service</b>	<b>340</b>
<b>Generator Performance</b>	<b>343</b>
Capacity Factor	343
Generator Performance Factors	344
Generator Outage Rates	346
Generator Testing Issues	350
<b>SECTION 6 Demand Response</b>	<b>353</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>353</b>
Recommendations	354
Conclusion	356
<b>PJM Demand Response Programs</b>	<b>359</b>
<b>Non-PJM Demand Response Programs</b>	<b>360</b>
<b>PJM Demand Response Programs</b>	<b>361</b>
Emergency and Pre-Emergency Load Response Programs	361
Economic Load Response Program	375
<b>Energy Efficiency</b>	<b>384</b>
<b>Peak Shaving Adjustment</b>	<b>388</b>
<b>Distributed Energy Resources</b>	<b>388</b>
<b>SECTION 7 Net Revenue</b>	<b>391</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>391</b>
Net Revenue	391
Recommendations	392
Conclusion	392
<b>Net Revenue</b>	<b>392</b>
Spark Spreads and Dark Spreads	393
Theoretical Energy Market Net Revenue	395
Capacity Market Net Revenue	397
<b>Net Revenue Adequacy</b>	<b>397</b>
Levelized Total Costs	397
Levelized Cost of Energy	398
New Entrant Combustion Turbine	398
New Entrant Combined Cycle	400
New Entrant Coal Plant	402
New Entrant Nuclear Plant	403
New Entrant Diesel	405
New Entrant Onshore Wind Installation	406
New Entrant Offshore Wind Installation	407
New Entrant Solar Installation	408

Historical New Entrant CC Revenue Adequacy	409
Factors in Net Revenue Adequacy	410
<b>Actual Net Revenue</b>	<b>412</b>
Competitiveness of Wind and Solar	415
Nuclear Net Revenue Analysis	416
<b>SECTION 8 Environmental and Renewable Energy Regulations</b>	<b>427</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>427</b>
Federal Environmental Regulation	427
State Environmental Regulation	428
State Renewable Portfolio Standards	429
Emissions Controls in PJM Markets	429
Renewable Generation	429
Recommendations	429
Conclusion	430
<b>Federal Environmental Regulation</b>	<b>432</b>
CAA: NESHAP/MATS	432
CAA: NAAQS/CSAPR	433
CAA: NSR	435
CAA: RICE	435
CAA: Greenhouse Gas Emissions	435
CWA: WOTUS Definition and Effluents	437
RCRA: Coal Ash	438
<b>State Environmental Regulation</b>	<b>440</b>
State Coal Ash Regulations	440
State Emissions Regulations	441
State Renewable Portfolio Standards	451
Transco Regional Energy Access Expansion Project	468
<b>Emission Controlled Capacity and Emissions</b>	<b>469</b>
Emission Controlled Capacity	469
Emissions	470
<b>Renewable Energy Output</b>	<b>472</b>
Wind and Solar Peak Hour Output	472
Wind Units	472
Solar Units	474
<b>SECTION 9 Interchange Transactions</b>	<b>477</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>477</b>
Interchange Transaction Activity	477
Interactions with Bordering Areas	477
Recommendations	478
Conclusion	479
<b>Interchange Transaction Activity</b>	<b>480</b>
Charges and Credits Applied to Interchange Transactions	480
Aggregate Imports and Exports	480
Real-Time Interface Imports and Exports	482
Real-Time Interface Pricing Point Imports and Exports	485
Day-Ahead Interface Imports and Exports	487

Day-Ahead Interface Pricing Point Imports and Exports	490
Loop Flows	493
PJM and MISO Interface Prices	499
PJM and NYISO Interface Prices	500
Summary of Interface Prices between PJM and Organized Markets	502
Neptune Underwater Transmission Line to Long Island, New York	503
Linden Variable Frequency Transformer (VFT) facility	504
Hudson Direct Current (DC) Merchant Transmission Line	505
Interchange Activity During High Load Hours	507
<b>Operating Agreements with Bordering Areas</b>	<b>507</b>
PJM and MISO Joint Operating Agreement	508
PJM and New York Independent System Operator Joint Operating Agreement (JOA)	509
PJM and TVA/LG&E and KU Joint Reliability Coordination Agreement (JRCA)	511
PJM and Duke Energy Progress, Inc. Joint Operating Agreement	511
PJM and VACAR South Reliability Coordination Agreement	511
Balancing Authority Operations Coordination Agreement between Wisconsin Electric Power Company (WEC) and PJM Interconnection, LLC	512
Northeastern ISO-Regional Transmission Organization Planning Coordination Protocol	512
<b>Interchange Transaction Issues</b>	<b>512</b>
PJM Transmission Loading Relief Procedures (TLRs)	512
Up To Congestion Transactions	513
Sham Scheduling	515
Elimination of Ontario Interface Pricing Point	516
PJM and NYISO Coordinated Interchange Transactions	517
Reserving Ramp on the PJM/NYISO Interface	520
PJM and MISO Coordinated Interchange Transaction Proposal	521
Willing to Pay Congestion and Not Willing to Pay Congestion	524
Transmission Service Requests	525
Spot Imports	525
Interchange Optimization	526
Interchange Cap During Emergency Conditions	527
45 Minute Schedule Duration Rule	527
MISO Multi-Value Project Usage Rate (MUR)	528
<b>SECTION 10 Ancillary Service Markets</b>	<b>531</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>532</b>
Primary Reserve	532
Synchronized Reserve Market	533
Nonsynchronized Reserve	534
30-Minute Reserve Market	534
Regulation Market	535
Black Start Service	536
Reactive	536
Frequency Response	537
Market Procurement of Real-Time Ancillary Services	537
Recommendations	538
Conclusion	540
<b>PJM Reserve Markets</b>	<b>541</b>

Implementation of PJM Reserve Markets	544
Reserve Subzones	547
<b>Primary Reserve</b>	<b>548</b>
Market Structure	548
Market Performance	550
<b>Synchronized Reserve</b>	<b>551</b>
Market Structure	551
Market Behavior	552
Market Performance	552
Synchronized Reserve Performance	556
<b>Nonsynchronized Reserve</b>	<b>565</b>
Market Structure	565
Market Behavior	566
Market Performance	566
<b>30-Minute Reserve</b>	<b>570</b>
Market Structure	570
Market Behavior	571
Market Performance	571
<b>Regulation Market</b>	<b>573</b>
Market Design	573
Market Structure	590
Market Conduct	594
Market Performance	597
<b>Black Start Service</b>	<b>602</b>
CRF Issues	605
NERC – CIP	607
<b>Reactive Service and Capability</b>	<b>607</b>
Issues with Reactive Capability Market Design	607
Reactive Costs	611
<b>Frequency Control Definition</b>	<b>613</b>
Primary Frequency Response	613
<b>SECTION 11 Congestion and Marginal Losses</b>	<b>615</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>617</b>
Congestion Cost	617
Marginal Loss Cost	617
System Energy Cost	618
Conclusion	618
<b>Issues</b>	<b>618</b>
Artificial Constraints, Closed Loop Interfaces and CT Pricing Logic	618
<b>Locational Marginal Price (LMP)</b>	<b>619</b>
Components	619
Hub Components	623
<b>Congestion</b>	<b>624</b>
Congestion Accounting	624
Total Congestion	627
<b>Charges and Credits versus Congestion: Virtual Transactions, Load and Generation</b>	<b>628</b>
UTCs and Negative Balancing Explicit CLMP Charges	630

Zonal and Load Aggregate Congestion	633
Fast Start Pricing Effect on Zonal Congestion	636
Monthly Congestion	637
<b>Congested Facilities</b>	<b>638</b>
Congestion Event Hours	639
Congestion by Facility Type and Voltage	641
Constraint Frequency	642
Top Constraints	643
Congestion Event Summary: Impact of Changes in UTC Volumes	648
<b>Marginal Losses</b>	<b>649</b>
Marginal Loss Accounting	649
Total Marginal Loss Cost	651
<b>System Energy Costs</b>	<b>656</b>
Energy Accounting	656
Total System Energy Costs	656
<b>SECTION 12 Generation and Transmission Planning</b>	<b>661</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>661</b>
Generation Interconnection Planning	661
Regional Transmission Expansion Plan (RTEP)	662
Transmission Facility Outages	663
Recommendations	663
Conclusion	666
<b>Generation Interconnection Planning</b>	<b>670</b>
Existing Generation Mix	670
Generation Retirements	674
Generation Queue	680
<b>Regional Transmission Expansion Plan (RTEP)</b>	<b>713</b>
RTEP Process	713
Market Efficiency Process	713
PJM MISO Interregional Market Efficiency Process (IMEP)	717
PJM MISO Targeted Market Efficiency Process (TMEP)	718
Multi Driver Process	719
New Jersey State Agreement Approach for Offshore Wind	719
Supplemental Transmission Projects	720
Competitive Planning Process Exclusions	723
Storage As A Transmission Asset (SATA)	724
Board Authorized Transmission Upgrades	725
Qualifying Transmission Upgrades (QTU)	725
Cost Allocation	726
<b>Transmission Line Ratings</b>	<b>726</b>
Dynamic Line Ratings (DLR) and Grid Enhancing Technology (GETs)	729
<b>Transmission Facility Outages</b>	<b>730</b>
Scheduling Transmission Facility Outage Requests	730
Rescheduling Transmission Facility Outage Requests	733
Long Duration Transmission Facility Outage Requests	734
Transmission Facility Outage Analysis for the FTR Market	735
Transmission Facility Outage Analysis in the Day-Ahead Energy Market	741



<b>SECTION 13 Financial Transmission and Auction Revenue Rights</b>	<b>743</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>747</b>
Auction Revenue Rights	747
Financial Transmission Rights	747
Recommendations	749
Conclusion	750
Proposed Design	752
<b>Auction Revenue Rights</b>	<b>753</b>
Market Design	754
Market Structure	755
Market Performance	755
IARRs	760
<b>Financial Transmission Rights</b>	<b>761</b>
Market Performance	766
<b>Surplus Congestion Revenue</b>	<b>785</b>
<b>Revenue Adequacy</b>	<b>787</b>
Target Allocations and Congestion by Constraint	791
<b>ARRs as an Offset to Congestion for Load</b>	<b>794</b>
Zonal ARR Congestion Offset	796
Offset if all ARR are Held as ARR	798
Offset if all ARR are Self Scheduled	798
ARR Allocation and Congestion In and Out of Zone	799
<b>Credit</b>	<b>800</b>
Default Portfolio Considerations	800
<b>FTR Forfeitures</b>	<b>801</b>